

1-1-2004

Race for the Senate—A Content Analysis of the Campaign Coverage of West Virginia Senate Candidates Marie Redd and Tom Scott in 1998 and Marie Redd and Evan Jenkins in 2002

Lynne Marsh
smarsh@gannett.com

Follow this and additional works at: <http://mds.marshall.edu/etd>

 Part of the [American Popular Culture Commons](#), [Feminist, Gender, and Sexuality Studies Commons](#), and the [Film and Media Studies Commons](#)

Recommended Citation

Marsh, Lynne, "Race for the Senate—A Content Analysis of the Campaign Coverage of West Virginia Senate Candidates Marie Redd and Tom Scott in 1998 and Marie Redd and Evan Jenkins in 2002" (2004). *Theses, Dissertations and Capstones*. Paper 118.

**RACE FOR THE SENATE – A CONTENT ANALYSIS OF THE
CAMPAIGN COVERAGE OF WEST VIRGINIA SENATE CANDIDATES
MARIE REDD AND TOM SCOTT IN 1998 AND
MARIE REDD AND EVAN JENKINS IN 2002**

**Thesis submitted to the
W. Page Pitt School of Journalism and Mass Communications and
The Graduate College of
Marshall University**

**In partial fulfillment of the
Requirements for the degree of
Master of Arts
in Journalism**

by

Lynne Marsh

**Dr. Harold Shaver, Committee Chairperson
Dr. Corley Dennison
Dr. Ralph Turner**

Marshall University

April 26, 2004

ABSTRACT

RACE FOR THE SENATE – A CONTENT ANALYSIS OF THE CAMPAIGN COVERAGE OF WEST VIRGINIA SENATE CANDIDATES MARIE REDD AND TOM SCOTT IN 1998 AND MARIE REDD AND EVAN JENKINS IN 2002

By Lynne Marsh

In the 1998 general election, Marie Redd became the first African American elected to the state senate in West Virginia. In the 5th District Senate race for her seat in the Legislature, Redd overcame the influence of opponent Tom Scott's incumbency, as well as his race and gender. Then, in the 2002 primary election, the freshman senator lost her seat to Evan Jenkins, also a caucasian male and a former member of the West Virginia House of Delegates. Previous research has shown that media treat candidates differently according to their race and gender and researchers have indicated the need for more studies in the areas of gender, race and politics. This content analysis of coverage of the West Virginia general election in 1998 and primary election in 2002 investigates the differences in coverage of the African American female candidate and the caucasian male candidates in the state's two largest newspapers, *The Herald-Dispatch* and *The Charleston Gazette*. This study focuses on the amount of coverage, the tone of stories, the placement of stories, and references to candidates' race, gender, and occupation.

DEDICATION

This research project is dedicated to my grandmother, Dorothy Fisher, whose love and support made it possible for me to achieve my dream of obtaining a Master of Arts degree from the W. Page Pitt School of Journalism and Mass Communications at Marshall University; and to the late Dr. Harold “Hal” Shaver, who was my guide and mentor throughout this project.

ACKNOWLEDGMENTS

I would like to acknowledge my thesis committee members, Dr. Harold Shaver, Dr. Corley Dennison, and Dr. Ralph Turner for their support and patience throughout this research process; Dr. Steven Banks for his help and guidance with the statistical analysis of this project; my husband, Thom, and children, Jennifer, Brandon, and Christopher, for their love and understanding during my graduate studies at Marshall University; Marilyn McClure, Jill Nevels-Haun, and Melissa Gabel for their help in coding stories for this project; and Dr. Paul Stewart, for his generous gift in support of thesis research projects at MU.

TABLE OF CONTENTS

<u>ABSTRACT</u>	ii
<u>DEDICATION</u>	iii
<u>ACKNOWLEDGMENTS</u>	iv
<u>TABLE OF CONTENTS</u>	v
<u>LIST OF FIGURES</u>	vi
<u>CHAPTER 1: Introduction</u>	1
Media stereotype in reporting.....	3
Media distort black reality.....	5
North Carolina’s 1996 campaigns were ‘race-baiting’.....	7
Black women must overcome race and gender.....	9
Theory.....	11
Society moves from social conflict toward structural functionalism.....	11
Critical theories concerned with conflict.....	12
Media intrusion theory makes politics a game.....	17
Critical race theory addresses racism, sexism, classism.....	20
Problem statement.....	21
Research questions and hypotheses.....	24
Methodology.....	26
<u>CHAPTER 2: Review of Literature</u>	27
Media coverage highlights race in bi-racial elections.....	28
Media coverage differs according to gender.....	29
Do racial cues affect election outcomes?.....	30
Voters usually favor incumbents.....	32
State legislatures becoming more diverse.....	32
Party affiliation is important.....	33
Summary of literature.....	34
<u>CHAPTER 3: Methodology</u>	35
Content categories.....	36
Coding.....	37
Treatment of data.....	40
<u>CHAPTER 4: Results</u>	42
Coverage of candidates.....	42
Placement of stories.....	43
Tone of story.....	46
Reference to candidates’ race, gender, and occupation.....	48
<u>CHAPTER 5: Discussion</u>	52
<u>Bibliography</u>	56
<u>Appendix</u>	61

LIST OF FIGURES

Placement of Story – 1998.....	44
Placement of Story – 2002.....	45
Tone of Story – 1998.....	46
Tone of Story – 2002.....	47
Reference to Marie Redd’s race – 1998.....	48
Reference to Marie Redd’s gender – 1998.....	48
Reference to Tom Scott’s occupation – 1998.....	49
Reference to Marie Redd’s race – 2002.....	49
Reference to Marie Redd’s gender – 2002.....	50

CHAPTER I

Introduction

In 1998, Marie Redd became the first African American elected to the State Senate in West Virginia. In the 5th District Senate race for her seat in the Legislature, Redd overcame the influence of opponent Tom Scott's incumbency, as well as his race and gender.

Observations of West Virginia media show that they have consistently referred to Redd, a Democrat, by race and gender, while Scott, a Republican, was simply referred to as a retired orthopedic surgeon. Furthermore, as Redd sought re-election in the 2002 primary, media coverage continued to focus on her race and gender to describe her while referring to her opponent Evan Jenkins by occupation.

"Stories about elections in those years referred to Marie by race," said Beth Gorczyca, a former reporter with The Herald-Dispatch who covered the elections and West Virginia Legislature. "Even when it was well-known that she was the first black woman to sit in the Senate, the media consistently used her race in her identification" (Gorczyca).

In a 1998 *Charleston Gazette* post-election story, The Associated Press noted that Redd was elected in Cabell County even though only 4 percent of the population was black. About 3 percent of West Virginia's 1.8 million people are black, the article noted. Furthermore, in a play on words the lead paragraph reads, "West Virginia voters say a woman's place is in the House – and the Senate" ("Number of female legislators").

After Redd's surprise win, *Herald-Dispatch* columnist Dave Peyton gave Redd a few words of wisdom:

The State Senate tends to be horribly chauvinistic and, yes, a bit racist. It's the very model of an old white man's club. The danger is that she'll be relegated to the back row by the leadership and become frustrated. Hang in there, Marie. No matter what they try to do to you up there, remember you're better than most of them can ever aspire to be. Make a difference. You can do it (Peyton).

In 2002, two months before the primary election, *The Herald-Dispatch* ran a lengthy column by Evan Jenkins, who was heavily campaigning for Marie Redd's seat in the Senate. In "Huntington deserves a big slice of state pie," Jenkins wrote about the projects that need completion. "We have critical needs in our region that require strong leadership to fight for our fair share."

Just 10 days after Jenkins' column appeared, a reader wrote of his disgust with the publication: "This was not a guest column. This was an unpaid political ad. The Herald-Dispatch should be ashamed to let a person such as Jenkins use its paper to announce his wish list," wrote Michael Salmons of Salt Rock. "He should have to pay for his political ads like everyone else" (Salmons).

Another pre-election editorial in *The Charleston Gazette* mentioned American's "condescension" with blacks. "They doubt that blacks are capable of attaining education and careers equal to whites. This 'looking down' upon blacks helps keep them in second-class status" (Unfair...Blacks are cheated).

Media stereotype in reporting

This type of coverage follows the stereotypical selection phase, described by Wilson and Gutierrez in *Race, Multiculturalism and the Media* (1995). Wilson

and Gutierrez write about five stages that can be identified historically that have affected news about people of color in white news media – exclusionary, threatening issue, confrontation, stereotypical selection and multiracial coverage phases.

Wilson and Gutierrez claim stereotypical selection-type of reporting is designed to neutralize white apprehension of people of color while accommodating their presence.

“Information items that conform to existing white attitudes toward other groups are then selected for inclusion in news media and given repeated emphasis until they reach thematic proportions,” Wilson and Gutierrez wrote.

Examples include news stories that ostensibly appear to be favorable to non-whites, as in the cases of “success stories.” These stories accomplish the two objectives of stereotypical selective reporting, Wilson and Gutierrez believe. The general audience is reassured that non-whites are still “in their place” and those who escape their designated place are not a threat to society because they manifest the same values and ambitions as the dominant culture (Wilson, Gutierrez).

David Domke and Kelley McCoy theorize in their study, “News Media, Racial Perceptions, and Political Cognition,” that news coverage of political issues not only influences people's thinking about the issues but also activates associated racial or ethnic stereotypes held by individuals (Domke, McCoy).

In their study, “How Gender and Ethnicity Affected Primary Coverage,” Angela Powers and Shirley Serini wrote that the media are often influenced by

the personal characteristics of political candidates. For example, research shows that Jesse Jackson was treated differently from other candidates partially because of his ethnic background (Powers, Serini).

“The media concentrated more on his style and less on his campaign issues,” Powers and Serini wrote.

Other research they found concludes that news creates an antagonism toward blacks pushing too hard and moving too fast and constructs an unfavorable contrast between black and white leaders. When dealing with gender, the media inherently communicate that women must succeed by using their physical attractiveness, research shows; and for females, candidate image was emphasized over campaign issues (Power, Serini).

In an example of this conclusion, columnist Dave Peyton notes Redd’s “charisma, charm and wit got her the office” in “Voters send a message by electing Redd, Egnor” (Peyton).

A 1995 poll commissioned by Harvard University, the Kaiser Family Foundation, and the *Washington Post* found that Americans across every racial group had a distorted sense of racial demographics, which in turn colored their views on social policy (“Journalism and race”).

“For the most part, scholarly research has come to similar conclusions, finding that African-Americans have been represented in unfavorable ways,” wrote Maria Christina Santana in her study, “News Coverage of Hispanics Surpasses Expectations” (Santana).

But William Cote and Fredrick Fico suggest in their study “Fairness and Balance in Election Reporting” that journalists may be unknowingly shaping stereotypes.

“Fairness and balance are central ethical tenants in modern American journalism, but defining and assessing them are formidable problems. Subjective judgments of these reporting qualities are implicitly biased and unreliable...For their part, journalists may be unaware of how their own biases can distort their coverage” (Cote, Fico).

Media distort black reality

In the early 1900s, sociologist W.E.B. DuBois forecasted that the color line would be the preeminent problem of the 20th century.

“The unfortunate reality, scholars argue, is that DuBois's insight remains true even more than 200 years after the founding of the United States and more than 150 years after the abolition of slavery,” Domke and McCoy write. “While white and black Americans in particular are deeply divided on a wide range of contemporary political issues and electoral preferences, a number of other racial and ethnic divisions also exist” (Domke, McCoy).

DuBois was concerned with the ways in which the media distorted black reality to a predominantly white America. As he advocated political, economic, and civil equality, the media consistently defined him as a “dangerous radical” (Coates).

DuBois frequently remarked that the primary function of the dominant media was to preserve the status quo by any means necessary (Coates):

There may come some argument as to who should belong to this ruling caste of the Efficient On the whole it would seem that wellbred persons of English descent and New England nurture are the kernel and hope of the land This hierarchy we should defend vigorously. For this, deliberate propaganda is necessary and permissible; propaganda assists the truth and hurries it on; it may at times exaggerate and distort but all this is for a defensible end and newspapers, radio channels, and news distribution agencies should be owned and used for this end (Coates).

Coates suggests that DuBois was well aware of how the media were used for propaganda purposes and ultimately decided to start his own – *The Crisis*, which became the official journal of the National Association for the Advancement of Colored People (NAACP). Coates concluded that the media, far from being an instrument of freedom, often have been an instrument of oppression (Coates).

This oppression also focuses on women in the media's stereotypical coverage. Herzog concludes that the media do more than hold up a mirror to sociopolitical processes; they are also one of society's mechanisms for strengthening and entrenching the social order. The media play a significant role in the ongoing construction of gender discourse, she said.

Augie Fleras also agrees with DuBois's reasoning.

As well as crystallizing power in the hands of those who do the defining, these images reinforce and transmit the prevailing values and beliefs of society, thus defining collective experience, shaping social consciousness, and legitimating the status quo. A clear message is articulated about who is normal and what is desirable (Fleras).

Coates also suggests the media serve to create an illusion that there exists a single spokesperson for the black population.

“Struggles for civil rights in America historically have involved a dialectic by which social activists often have been placed in opposing camps. Usually, this dialectical process was either implicitly or explicitly characterized by attempts to divide and thus diminish the radical influence of the social movement,” he said (Coates).

North Carolina’s 1996 campaigns were ‘race-baiting’

In 1996, in a political race similar to Redd’s campaigns against Scott and Jenkins, longtime U.S. Senator Jesse Helms, R-N.C., defeated former Charlotte, N.C., Mayor Harvey Gantt for the second time by 53-47 percent of the votes. Gantt, the first black to attend Clemson University and the first black man to ever receive a nomination from the Democratic Party for U.S. Senate, first ran against Helms in 1990 in what is known as one of the most race-baiting campaigns in history (“Action Replay”).

In 1990, Helms charged Gantt with betraying the black community by selling his stake in a television station, an interest that had been acquired cheaply under a minority-business program. Next came an ad showing Gantt accepting a campaign contribution from Jesse Jackson. The state Republican Party then mailed out 150,000 postcards to residents of heavily black precincts warning that anyone who violated regulations by giving erroneous information while voting could spend five years in prison (Barrett, Kane).

The most effective blow came eight days before the election. A widely broadcast commercial that was quickly dubbed the “white hands” spot showed the hands of a worker crumpling a letter of rejection. The narration said, “You needed that job, but they had to give it to a minority because of a racial quota. Is that really fair? Gantt says it is” (Barrett, Kane).

The ad cinched the election for Helms, who claimed 52 percent of the votes compared to Gantt’s 48 percent (Barrett, Kane).

Research indicates that in 1990, numerous Republican candidates running for U.S. offices used Jesse Jackson and racial quotas as blunt instruments to “persuade” white voters that their interests lay in electing Republican candidates who knew how to keep the “dangerous” blacks in their place. Many observers noted that despite Jackson's emphasis on class issues, particularly in the 1988 campaign, he symbolized “race” to many white voters (Edsall, Edsall; Franklin).

But Walter Williams, a black conservative with a different point of view, wrote in *Capitalist Magazine*, “Black people are taught that every waking thought of white America is racist; black people are perennial victims of white oppression; we have no control over our lives and destiny. The only way black people can achieve anything is to prey upon white guilt, and seek special privileges like quotas, handouts, and lately reparations and apologies for slavery.”

This view is also expressed by George Bush's 1992 primary challenger and conservative media commentator Pat Buchanan:

Why did liberalism fail black America? Because it was built on a myth, the myth of the Kerner Commission, that the last great

impediment to equality in America was “white racism.” ... There was a time when white racism did indeed block black progress in America; but by the time of the Kerner Commission, ours was a nation committed to racial justice.... What the black poor need more than anything today is a dose of the truth. Slums are the products of the people who live there. Dignity and respect are not handed out like food stamps; they are earned and won.... The first step to progress, for any group, lies in the admission that its failures are, by and large, its own fault, that success can come only through its own efforts, that, while the well-intentioned outsider may help, he or she is no substitute for personal sacrifice (Edsall, Edsall).

Black women must overcome race and gender

Still, research shows black women have the hardest obstacle to overcome in the American political arena. They must overcome invisibility in a country that has traditionally viewed “African American progress as male, and feminist progress as white (Clayton, Stallings).” Black women have to overcome a double disadvantage at the polls, confronting biases related to race and gender (Clayton, Stallings).

The Eagleton Institution of Politics at Rutgers University said today’s national government is still dominated by white males: 86 percent are men and 81 percent are white.

“Many voters are simply reluctant to vote for a black or a female, let alone a black female,” Clayton and Stallings suggest. Black women find the need to strike an appropriate balance by not appearing overly aggressive, the researchers suggest. Black female politicians have commented on the need to strike a delicate balance and appeal to all segments of the voting population (Clayton, Stallings).

In an excerpt from her book, *Gender and Journalism in Industrialized Nations*, Margaret Gallagher examines gender trends in journalism as well as the progress women journalists are making.

Wherever one looks in the world, women still have relatively little decision-making power either inside the media organizations themselves, or in the political and economic institutions with which these organizations must interface. The male-defined rules of the game which determine journalistic culture – the customs and practices which prevail within the profession – must therefore be understood...In a more fundamental sense these rules permeate the very essence of what journalism “is,” or is believed to be, but the majority of the practitioners (Gallagher).

Marie Wilson, president of The White House Project, a nonpartisan organization that seeks to get more women into leadership roles, wrote a new book about this lack of progress for women. In *Closing the Gap: Why Women Can and Must Help Run the World* she says the media don’t take women politicians seriously. She cites a White House Project study:

On *Meet the Press* and other Sunday-morning TV talk shows, which often shape policy, male guest outnumbered women 13 to 1 after 9/11, though Dianne Feinstein and two other women chaired Senate subcommittees on terrorism. Wilson adds that when the media do cover women, the focus is on personal issues such as appearance; men are more likely to have their positions discussed (Wilson).

In *Media Power in Politics*, Doris Grube wrote that political campaign organizations frequently blame the media when their candidate loses a race.

“It is one thing for politicians to try to create a particular image and another for that image to be conveyed to newspeople and, through them, to the voting public,” she wrote (Grube).

Because vigorous, information-rich electoral contests are essential to the democratic process, scholars regularly put the activities of the media and other involved parties under a microscope to discover the factors influencing election outcomes, Grube said (Grube).

Theory

In many historical cases, victory by a challenger for political dominance over an initially dominant group, such as Marie Redd's victory over Tom Scott, has ended civil conflict. But in other places, victory by a challenger has provided only a temporary respite, a brief intermission before the resumption of civil conflict (Gershenson, Grossman).

Society moves from social conflict toward structural functionalism

Civil conflict, or social conflict, theory holds that societal change comes from opposing forces. Karl Marx was one of a few theorists who formed the idea that social conflict and the dialectic process, based on the Socratic method, result in changes in society. He believed that social conflicts would finally produce synthesis where no conflicts were left, and history would come to an end. This synthesis was socialism, an ideal society or Utopia, where everyone would be happy without conflict (Marx).

In the case of Marie Redd versus Tom Scott and Marie Redd versus Evan Jenkins, a shift from social conflict could lead to structural functionalism, where society moves toward a state of harmony. Plato writes about this harmony:

— It is not the law's concern to make some one group in the city outstandingly happy but to contrive to spread happiness throughout the city, by bringing the citizens into harmony with each other by persuasion or compulsion, and to make them share with each other the benefits which each group can confer upon the community. The law has not made men of this kind in the city in order to allow each to turn in any direction they wish but to make use of them to bind the city together (Grube).

Critical theories concerned with conflict

Some argue that the best way to theorize about the media is through critical theory, defined as “a loose confederation of ideas held together by a common interest in the quality of communication of human life. They are especially concerned with inequality and oppression. Critical theories do not merely observe; they also criticize. Most critical theories are concerned with the conflict of interests in society and the ways communication perpetuates domination of one group over another (Baran).”

Some critical theorists suggest that media in general sustain the status quo. A common theme in critical theories of media is that content production is so constrained that it inevitably reinforces the status quo and undermines useful efforts for constructive social change (Baran).

Building on his social conflict theory, Marx defined in 1843 critical theory as “the self-clarification of the struggles and wishes of the age (Livingstone).”

“What is so appealing about this definition is its straightforwardly political character. It makes no claim to any special epistemological status, but, rather, supposes that with respect to justification there is no philosophically interesting difference between a critical theory of society and an uncritical one,” writes

Nancy Fraser in her inquiry, "What's Critical About Critical Theory? The Case of Habermas and Gender (Fraser)."

Fraser makes her case that theorist Jurgen Habermas' model of critical theory has some empirical deficiencies in that it is not easily able to pick up on some dimensions of male dominance in modern societies. She also claims a serious deficiency exists in Habermas' *Theory of Communicative Action* (1984) in that it says virtually nothing about gender:

Habermas' blindspots are instructive, I think. They permit us to conclude something about what the categorical framework of a socialist-feminist critical theory of welfare capitalism should look like. One crucial requirement is that this framework not be such as to put the male-headed, nuclear family and the state-regulated official economy on two opposite sides of the major categorical divide. We require, rather, a framework sensitive to the similarities between them, one which puts them on the same side of the line as institutions which, albeit in different ways, enforce women's subordination, since both family and official economy appropriate our labor, shortcircuit our participation in the interpretation of our needs and shield normatively-secured need interpretations from political contestation (Fraser).

Still, Habermas' framework does offer a conceptual resource suitable for understanding other aspects of modern male dominance (Fraser). For example, in the role of the worker, she claims it is not that women are absent from the paid workforce,

It's rather that they are present differently, as feminized and sometimes sexualized "service" workers (secretaries, domestic workers, salespersons, prostitutes, and more recently, flight attendants); as members of the "helping professions" utilizing mothering skills (nurses, social workers, child care workers, primary school teachers); as targets of sexual harassment; as low-wage, low-skilled, low-status workers in sex-segregated occupations; as part-time workers; as workers who work a double shift (both unpaid domestic labor and paid labor); as "working wives" and "working

mothers,” i.e. as primarily wives and mothers who happen, secondarily, also to “go out to work”; as “supplemental earners” (Fraser).

“These differences in the quality of women’s presence in the paid workplace testify to the conceptual dissonance between femininity and the worker role in classical capitalism. And this in turn confirms the masculine subtext of that role,” Fraser claims. But Fraser says once the gender-blindness of Habermas’ model is overcome,

It then becomes clear that feminine and masculine gender identity run like pink and blue threads through the areas of paid work, state administration, and citizenship as well as through the domain of familial and sexual relations. This is to say that gender identity is lived out in all arenas of life. It is one (if not the) “medium of exchange” among all of them, a basic element of the social glue that binds them to one another. Moreover, a gender-sensitive reading of these connections has some important theoretical and conceptual implications. It reveals that male dominance is intrinsic rather than accidental to classical capitalism (Fraser).

In “Rethinking Critical Theory: Weaknesses and New Directions,” Dieter Freundlieb asserts that a critical theory must be able to point to certain identifiable pathologies of society, whether they are perceived by its members or not.

“Critical theory has always aimed to achieve a comprehensive critique of society and a vision of a more just and rational order,” Freundlieb writes (Freundlieb).

Orville Lee seems to agree with Freundlieb in his “Culture and Democratic Theory: Toward a Theory of Symbolic Democracy:”

A cultural theory of power is required to account for the structure and function of the symbolic relations of power and their effects on associational life, and on individual and collective identities. Alternatives to Frankfurt School cultural criticism should be investigated which can be made compatible with democratic theory. Such an alternative cultural critique is necessary, especially for those instances of social status inequality (e.g., gender, race, and sexuality) that cannot be traced only to the colonization of the lifeworld, but rather are the products of cultural logics that are constitutive of the intersubjective relationships that comprise the lifeworld (Lee).

New discussions of Marx from those associated with critical theory states the importance of Hegel's dialectic for comprehending and restating Marx's vision of society is being largely passed over, despite Marx's insistence that the Hegelian dialectic "remains the source of all dialectic (Hudis)."

Hudis suggests that the depth of Marx's challenge to capitalism cannot be fully comprehended, let alone restated for today's realities, without a re-encounter with Marx's rootedness in and transcendence of Hegel's dialectical philosophy. Hudis explains that in Hegel's dialectic of negativity, all movement proceeds through the power of negativity, the negation of obstacles to the subject's self-development. The actual transcendence of these obstacles is reached, not simply through the negation of their immediate and external forms of appearance (which Hegel calls first negation), but through "the negation of the negation." In the "negation of the negation," the power of negativity gets turned back upon the self, upon the internal as well as external barriers to self-movement. This movement through the negation of the negation, or absolute negativity, is what produces the positive (Hudis).

Marx wrote about his new humanism and its roots in Hegel's dialectic in the *Critique of the Hegelian Dialectic* (1958). In this account, Hudis claims Marx is critical of Hegel for suggesting that the world of actual existence is the result of a purely logical movement:

Marx rejects as an idealist illusion any suggestion that actual, positive existence is the result of some "spiritual" or logical movement through double negation. Marx's point is that because Hegel dehumanizes the subject of the dialectic, in presenting it as mere disembodied consciousness instead of live men and women, transcendence in Hegel becomes a mere reflection of abstract thought upon itself. The transcendence of alienation is therefore obtained at the price of the transcendence of objectivity. This means, Marx argues, that Hegel's concept of self-movement through double negation becomes an idealist abstraction which leaves the actual alienations in the real world untouched. Therein, he says, lies Hegel's "uncritical positivism and extant empiricism" (Hudis).

Still, one reads about Hegel's dialectical categories in a careful reading of Karl Marx's and Fredrich Engels' *The Communist Manifesto* (1984), Hudis claims.

Take one of its most famous lines – "the theory of the Communists may be summed up in the single sentence: Abolition of private property." Marx focuses on the need to negate the institution of private property because it is the most immediate expression of the power of bourgeois society over the worker. Through the bourgeois property relation, the worker is forced to sell herself for a wage to the owners of capital, who appropriate the products of her productive activity. Without the abolition of this property relation, the economic and political domination of the bourgeoisie remains unchallenged (Hudis).

Scholars of the Frankfurt School believed philosophy, in the shape of Hegelian and Marxian dialectics, was to define the image of society that was to guide sociology and also society.

In “Worlds Come Apart: Systems Theory versus Critical Theory – Drama in the History of Sociology in the Twentieth Century,” Uta Gerhardt, says the Frankfurt School scholars were concerned throughout their exile with the dangers in American society, insofar as these could be understood by analyzing German society.

The Frankfurt School scholars advocated politicization of sociology as an antidote against presumed dangers of “false consciousness.” The “formal freedom” of pluralist democracy, they felt, obliterated the chances for a revolution that would at last overcome capitalist society altogether. They advocated Marxism as a theoretical perspective, condemning the predominance of “late” capitalism and arguing for the historical necessity of a future society reconciling the contradictions of today's world (Gerhardt).

This capitalism may be to blame in media's coverage of election campaign, some researchers suggest.

In “Ideology, imagology, and critical thought: the impoverishment of politics,” Jon Simons wrote, “political choice becomes indistinguishable from consumer choice, but in a context in which choices are heavily influenced by appeals to emotions and tastes, rather than reflected judgement (Simons).”

He quotes Milan Kundera: “The whole art of politics these days lies not in running the polls, but in thinking up ‘sound bites’ by which the politician is seen and understood, measured in opinion polls, and elected or rejected in elections.”

The blame lies in the capitalist goals of the media, Simons believes. He refers to author Bob Franklin's *Packaging Politics* (London: Edward Arnold, 1994):

Franklin argues that Britain . . . has become a media democracy in which politicians and policies are packaged for media marketing and public consumption . . . Media democracy . . . is characterized by an absence of direct political debate; voters have become spectators rather than participants in debate. What should be a deafening but necessarily discordant chorus of democratic voices has been reduced to a carefully orchestrated silence (Simons).

Media intrusion theory makes politics a game

When debate is presented through the media, the conversation is itself administered and treated as a consumer item, while on the whole the mass appeal of culture has depended on fulfilling demands for relaxation and entertainment rather than imposing educational demands on an audience, Simons wrote.

The media orient themselves to the consensus by aligning with the state or nation, and by remaining neutral or balanced in relation to partisan positions. The media thus reinforce the dominant framework of meaning within which partisan disagreements occur (Simons).

Simons' claims can be explained as media intrusion theory, the idea that media have intruded into and taken over politics to the degree that politics have become subverted. Media intrusion theorists argue that the media have subverted politics by undermining political party control over elections. Candidates no longer need party support and hire political consultants to guide their media use. (Baron)

In *Mass Communication Theory – Foundations, Ferment, and Future*,

Stanley J. Baron and Dennis K. Davis wrote about media intrusion theory:

Politics is often reported as a game between opposing teams with the major politicians viewed as star players. These reports don't help news consumers develop useful understanding of politics. Rather, they encourage consumers to become political spectators, content to sit on the sidelines while the stars play the game (Baron).

Media intrusion theory and Habermas' model of critical theory also are apparent in media coverage, which often treats female leaders as less than capable. For example, when a male television host interviewed Dorcas R. Hardy, commissioner of Social Security, about the changes in the institution, he concluded the interview by saying, "You're the first woman and the youngest person to head this institution. Don't you feel overwhelmed (Biagi, Kern-Foxworth)?"

"Is it pertinent that she is the first woman and youngest? Perhaps, although the constant stress on 'first women' in stories says, 'This person is unlike all others of her sex.' The question implies that she may not be up to such an important job. The value of the official's work was trivialized by the interviewer as he focused on her sex, rather than on what she does," Shirley Biagi and Marilyn Kern-Foxworth wrote in *Facing Difference – Race, Gender, and Mass Media* (1997).

"Often reporters treat men and women unequally. Other non-equal treatment is evident when members of minority groups are labeled by race. For example, 'Black poet Maya Angelou spoke to 500 people about her new book.'

Would anyone write, 'White poet Tim McAfee is memorialized in one of his student's poems?' ” Biagi and Kern-Foxworth claim.

Fraser also talks about this inequality as two “systems” of oppression – capitalism and male dominance. “But this is misleading,” she says (Frasure).

These are not, in fact, two distinct systems but, rather, two thoroughly interfused dimensions of a single social formation. In order to understand that social formation, a critical theory requires a single set of categories and concepts which integrate internally both gender and political economy, and perhaps also race (Frasure).

These marginalized groups have deployed experiential and historical knowledge of oppressed identities to further their claims in the political arena, according to Mariana Valverde in “Identity Politics and the Law in the United States (Valverde).”

Critical race theory addresses racism, sexism, classism

Valverde explains the development of critical race theory in the second half of the 1980s as an “uneasy but fruitful synthesis of the analytical tools of critical (mainly Marxist) legal studies and the identity politics developed by a handful of legal academics of color (Valverde).”

This critical race theory is a framework that can address the racism, sexism, and classism embedded in today's media, and draws from and extends a broad literature base in law, sociology, history, ethnic studies, and women's studies, wrote Tara J. Yosso in “Critical Race Media Literacy: Challenging Deficit Discourse About Chicanas/os (Yosso).”

But the –isms that Yosso refers to and other social issues are likely to be lost in the world of media giants, says Robert McChesney, a professor at the University of Illinois in Campaign-Urbana and acting editor of *Monthly Review: An Independent Socialist Magazine* (McChesney).

McChesney argues that “professional journalism” has led the press to continue its watchdog role while avoiding stories with no news hook, including those concerning social issues (McChesney).

“So journalism tended to downplay or eliminate the presentation of a range of informed positions on controversial issues,” McChesney said. “This produces a paradox: Journalism which, in theory, should inspire political involvement tends to strip politics of meaning and promote a broad depoliticization” (McChesney).

Problem statement

In the 1998 general election, Marie Redd, a newcomer to West Virginia politics and an African American female, beat incumbent Tom Scott, a caucasian male orthopedic surgeon, for a seat in the State Senate. In the 2002 primary election, the freshman senator lost her seat to Evan Jenkins, also a caucasian male and a former member of the West Virginia House of Delegates.

Researchers have indicated the need for more studies in the areas of gender, race and politics. Power and Serini suggest the need for more research in the area of news coverage of political campaigns involving race and gender.

“Understanding patterns of news coverage of political campaigns becomes increasingly important as more female and minority candidates run for office,” they wrote. “While many studies analyze media coverage of political campaigns, most concern white, male presidential campaigns or the campaigns of incumbents. They reflect neither the dynamics of lower-level elections nor the increasingly diverse candidate pools” (Powers, Serini).

Cote and Fico also address the need for more research of local and statewide elections by local and statewide media.

“Most election studies have focused on national television networks and prestige newspapers that cover presidential races. Coverage of elections by more typical news media have been ignored,” they suggest (Cote, Fico).

In “Why Do the News Media Cover Certain Candidates More Than Others?” Audrey A. Haynes and Sarah G. Murray suggest that much media election coverage is dominated by the “game” or horse race.

“The game predominates in that news outlets often have material concerns that motivate their presentation of the news,” the researchers write. “By presenting the campaign in an exciting framework of winners and losers, they make it more attractive to consumers. Moreover, they simplify a very complex process for their audience by framing it as a competitive game focusing on the score and the key players... An examination of the horse race and activity perspectives may help us understand why the news media focus their attention on some candidates more than others (Haynes, Murray).”

Researchers explain these “games” as media intrusion theory, the idea that media have intruded into and taken over politics to the degree that politics have become subverted.

In Grube’s *Media Power in Politics*, William C. Adams suggests the need for research of media treatment of political candidates.

“The concern is...differences in media messages and whether a candidate is portrayed more favorably...Treatment of the candidates may well be an especially vital element,” he wrote (Grube).

Critical race theory takes into consideration these identity politics and the analytical tools of critical legal studies, and addresses the racism, sexism, and classism some researchers claim is embedded in today’s media.

Research has shown and theories suggest that media treat candidates differently according to their race and gender. Therefore, will a content analysis of coverage of the West Virginia general election in 1998 and primary election in 2002 show a difference in coverage of the African American female candidate and the caucasian male candidates?

Research questions and hypotheses

In order to answer the research problem outlined above, the following research questions and hypotheses are posed:

- RQ1: How did newspapers treat Redd and Scott, i.e. who was shown more in photographs and who received the most coverage during the 1998 election campaign?
- RQ2: Which candidate, Marie Redd or Tom Scott, received better story placement during the 1998 election campaign?
- RQ3: What is the frequency of reference to race, gender, and occupation in newspaper coverage of Marie Redd and Tom Scott during the 1998 election campaign?
- RQ4: Did stories about Redd and Scott during the 1998 election campaign have a positive, neutral, or negative tone?
- RQ5: How did newspapers treat Redd and Jenkins, i.e. who was shown more in photographs and who received the most coverage during the 2002 election campaign?
- RQ6: Which candidate, Marie Redd or Evan Jenkins, received better story placement during the 2002 election campaign?
- RQ7: What is the frequency of reference to race, gender, and occupation in newspaper coverage of Marie Redd and Evan Jenkins during the 2002 election campaign?
- RQ8: Did stories about Redd and Jenkins during the 2002 election campaign have a positive, neutral, or negative tone?

- H1: Marie Redd received more coverage than Tom Scott during the 1998 election campaign.
- H2: Tom Scott received better story placement than Marie Redd during the 1998 election campaign.
- H3: During the 1998 election campaign, newspapers referred to Marie Redd by race and gender while referring to Tom Scott by occupation.
- H4: Stories about Tom Scott had a more positive tone than stories about Marie Redd.
- H5: Marie Redd received more coverage than Evan Jenkins during the 2002 election campaign.
- H6: Evan Jenkins received better story placement than Marie Redd during the 2002 election campaign.
- H7: During the 2002 election campaign, newspapers referred to Marie Redd by race and gender while referring to Evan Jenkins by occupation.
- H8: Stories about Evan Jenkins had a more positive tone than stories about Marie Redd.

Methodology

To answer these research questions, a content analysis of newspaper coverage during the 1998 and 2002 elections was performed. The decision to use newspaper coverage is based on two considerations. First, print media are more likely to assist readers in identifying candidates' assets and liabilities (Terkildsen and Damore). Second, the cost of obtaining archival television footage exceeds the cost of obtaining print archives.

Data were retrieved from *The Herald-Dispatch* and *The Charleston Gazette*, the two largest circulation newspapers in West Virginia. All articles published between September 1, 1998, through the week following the General Election in 1998 and March 1, 2002, through the week following the Primary Election in 2002 and were included in the study.

CHAPTER II

Review of Literature

When media cover political elections involving candidates of two different races – white and black – and two different genders, they must choose how they will treat the candidates in their coverage.

A 56-page study produced by the Center for Integration and Improvement of Journalism at San Francisco State University called “News Watch, A Critical Look at Coverage of People of Color,” found that “the mainstream media’s coverage of people of color is riddled with old stereotypes, offensive terminology, biased reporting and myopic interpretations of American society. In day-to-day coverage, minorities often are ignored except for certain categories of stories – notably, crime, sports, and entertainment” (Stein).

Cote and Fico found that the press cover conflict unequally in terms of fairness and balance. Their study also suggests that election coverage may give some candidates more opportunity than opponents to assert their views (Cote, Fico).

Many researchers have been studying and examining the media’s treatment of candidates in biracial elections as well as its treatment of male and female candidates. Research shows this treatment is important to political campaigns. Positive tone and amount of coverage have a positive impact on election outcomes (Freitag).

Additionally, the results of Domke and McCoy’s research suggest that news coverage influences the considerations that individuals draw on in thinking

about political issues, and that news coverage of issues also influences which racial cognitions are activated and how strongly those cognitions are linked to political judgments (Domke, McCoy).

Media coverage highlights race in bi-racial elections

Prior research demonstrates that race is often central to the coverage of elections when African-American candidates compete (Terkildsen, Damore).

In their 1998 study, Terkildsen and Damore conclude that media nearly always accent the race of black candidates, particularly when they are competing in biracial elections, but rarely, if ever, mention the race of white candidates, regardless of the race of their competitors.

Other studies agree with the conclusions that Terkildsen and Damore have reached. Zilber (2000) notes in his study of “Stereotypes in the News,” that media coverage emphasizes the race of African-American candidates while typically ignoring the race or ethnicity of white candidates. Marilyn Halter (2000) wrote in *Shopping for Identity – The Marketing of Ethnicity*, “Typically, race is used only as a designator for those who are nonwhite; when left unqualified, an assumed whiteness is implied.”

In their study, Terkildsen and Damore quote Tom Bradley, an African-American who failed twice in his bid to become governor of California, “Politicians who are black once again become black politicians” thanks to the media, who, for whatever reason, determine that the candidate’s race is part of “all the news that’s fit to print” (Terkildsen, Damore).

The media tout themselves as unbiased and non-racist, but research shows that while the media work at suppressing race as an issue during elections, they are highlighting the race of African-American candidates (Terkildsen, Damore).

“At the same time that the press monitors the racial references of others, they are in the position to underscore race themselves. This may be done for a variety of economic, professional, and personal reasons,” Terkildsen and Damore suggest.

Domke wrote that many have theorized that the press’s selection and framing of language, news, opinion, and perceptions convey and abet a social reality that legitimates the practices and ideas of the dominant social class, in this case, the white majority.

Media coverage differs according to gender

In her study of women and politics between 1950 and 1989, Herzog says women who enter politics deviate from women's traditional modes of activity. The media counter this deviation in a variety of ways, including running photos of female models or printing a recipe alongside an article about women in politics, when the latter are photographed in their kitchen or in "feminine" poses. Reporters also frame the theme of the story by asking certain questions, the most common which is “What's it like to be a woman politician? (Herzog).”

“The press does not conspire to ignore, stereotype, marginalize, or trivialize female politicians to keep them out of politics. It is part of their taken-for-

granted frames and perceptions of social reality. In most cases, we can expose textual strategies in which criticism or normative deterrence is implicit. Often, the message is concealed in articles that might initially seem sympathetic” (Herzog).

In their study, Powers and Serini found gender, as well as ethnic background, does influence press coverage.

“Coverage of the white, male candidate, was more often issue-oriented than was coverage for the female or minority candidate” (Powers, Serini).

Do racial cues affect election outcomes?

While debates are taking place as to the media’s use of race and gender in their coverage of political candidates, researchers know very little about how coverage of black and white candidates affects voter perceptions and election outcomes.

Racialized media coverage takes on increased importance in biracial elections. Emphasizing race in these contests either visually or in print provides a powerful vote cue for both prejudiced and nonprejudiced citizens (Terkildsen, Damore). For the prejudiced, race will prime their racial values, while for nonprejudiced voters race will likely cue stereotypical processing unless an alternative belief system is activated (Terkildsen, Damore).

Significant barriers remain for blacks seeking public offices. They are substantially underrepresented in the pool of candidates seeking office, much less likely to win in majority-white districts, and more likely to be stereotyped by white voters (Terkildsen, Damore).

Researchers have observed that the cultural indicators of minorities, presented through the media to non-minority members, are capable of creating impressions (Atwater, Anokwa) that ultimately may affect the outcome of an election, such as with the “white hands” ad during the North Carolinians Jesse Helms and Harvey Gantt election in 1990.

Powers and Serini found that media take more seriously the traditional, male candidates, while viewing the others as exceptions to the rule (Powers, Serini).

Terkildsen and Damore believe highlighting race in low-information elections can affect voters’ judgments about African-Americans. If race is a viable cue in low-information elections, the less informed citizens’ vote choices should be partially or fully based on racial stereotypes (Terkildsen, Damore).

Cumulative reinforcement of race in campaign coverage may likely ensure that even in high-information contests, race remains a salient vote factor (Terkildsen, Damore).

Other problems with racialized coverage is that the picture painted by typical media is that of an African-American elected official who is overly concerned with race, especially in a local context, and who is largely adrift in the legislative process (Zilber). When asked for comments, it is the African-American member who will be turned to for a comment on civil rights, and the white northern member for issues of more general concern to liberals (Zilber).

Voters usually favor incumbents

As if overcoming these obstacles isn't enough, political races against incumbents historically have been all but fatal to a candidate's own political life.

Studies of state legislative elections over a 20-year period have consistently shown that incumbents who seek reelection have had a very high rate of success. In fact, 90.3 percent of all state senators seeking reelection and 92.3 percent of all state representatives were successful from 1968-1988 (Jewell).

During these years, the rate of success for incumbents climbed moderately. The rate of reelection in the state Senate rose from 88.2 percent in the 1968-1977 period to 92.0 percent in the 1978-1988 period; the House reelection rate rose from 90.8 percent to 93.5 percent (Jewell).

In West Virginia the rate of reelection was a little lower; 83.9 percent of the nominated incumbents were reelected from 1968-1988 (Jewell).

But could the successes be because the strong, entrenched incumbents usually draw weak challengers, or none at all, Jewell questions?

State legislatures becoming more diverse

Since the passage of the Voting Rights Act of 1965, the number of African Americans serving in state legislatures throughout the nation dramatically increased from a mere 64 to 406 in 1988 (Clemons, Jones).

“The emergence of a black presence in the state legislative process provides an opportunity for the systematic advancement of African American political and socioeconomic interests,” Clemons and Jones believe.

In 1964 there were only 104 black elected officials in the entire nation. By 1989 there were 4,021 black elected officials in the southern region (Clemons, Jones).

Party affiliation is important

Another variable is that African-American voters strongly support the Democrat Party while white southerners, by contrast, display a strain of political conservatism that has been funneling them toward the GOP (Clemons, Jones).

There also are unusually high levels of support for the Democratic Party in the Appalachian highlands. Although they were historically Unionist and Republican in the 19th century, the poor, rural, and overwhelmingly white areas are more likely to support Democrats than the growing number of suburban and small-town districts with only slightly more diverse demographics, Lublin and Voss suggest.

The all-white Democrat districts consistently appear within the Appalachian region, Lublin and Voss conclude.

Off-year voter registration in Cabell County, West Virginia, shows Democrats comprised 27,422, or 58.9 percent, of the total 46,569 in 1998 and 24,560, or 57.3 percent, of the total 42,845 voters in 2002. (Off-year voter Registration)

Summary of literature

Studies of racialized media coverage indicate the media are doing a better job in their coverage, but still frequently maintain a “them” and “us” mentality when reporting on African-American groups. This biased coverage puts African-American political candidates at a disadvantage, especially in a border state such as West Virginia where many citizens haven’t shed their Southern sympathies.

Additionally, studies of Appalachian society have noted a “low” domestic morality of the people, and the “frail” virtue of the women in particular (Klotter).

In 1967, the Kerner Commission studied the effects of media coverage on the civil rights activities and riots. The report, following violent civil unrest in the late 1960s, noted that the media have been one of the contributing factors to the massive disruption of certain parts of America. More specifically, the report criticized the media for its biased, stereotypical, and unbalanced coverage (Biagi, Kern-Foxworth). When its report was issued in 1968, it condemned a historical trend in news coverage by a press that “has too long basked in a white world, looking out of it, if at all, with white men’s eyes and a white perspective.” (Wilson, Gutierrez) Its conclusion indicated that America was moving toward two societies, one white and one black, separate and unequal.

CHAPTER III

Methodology

This study examined newspaper coverage devoted to one African American female candidate (Marie Redd) and one caucasian male candidate (Tom Scott) in the 1998 West Virginia Senate race during the general election and newspaper coverage devoted to one African American female candidate (Marie Redd) and one caucasian male candidate (Evan Jenkins) in the 2002 West Virginia Senate race during the primary election. A content analysis of newspaper articles from September 1, 1998, through one week following the general election in 1998 and March 1, 2002, through one week following the primary election in 2002 was conducted using the state's two largest daily circulation newspapers, *The Herald-Dispatch* and *The Charleston Gazette*.

Because the Federal Communications Commission generally recognizes that advertising increases about 60 days preceding an election, it was presumed there also should be more articles about each candidate 60 days before an election. The time period also includes one week following each election because the newspapers generally continue their coverage of the candidates during this period.

The researcher collected a census of all articles and visual components of the candidates during the time period from each newspaper's microfilm archives. Articles, headlines, visual components, and cutlines were collected from all editions and all sections of the newspapers and then used as the unit of analysis.

The exception is the editorial or opinion page because this research is focusing on news coverage instead of opinion and commentary.

Content categories

This study is designed to determine how much coverage was devoted to each candidate and the tone of the coverage. The procedure for the analysis was: (1) Quantity of coverage was measured as to the number of stories that discusses each candidate; (2) Visual components were measured in the same manner; (3) Stories were measured as to whether they imply a positive, neutral, or negative tone; and (4) References to each candidate's race and gender also were measured.

Categories used in this study include:

1) Quantity of stories

The purpose of measuring the quantity of stories is to develop a ratio of stories covering Marie Redd and those covering Tom Scott and Evan Jenkins. Percentages are calculated in addition to the actual number of stories. Stories are recorded as stories about Marie Redd only, stories about Tom Scott only, stories about Evan Jenkins only, stories about Marie Redd and Tom Scott equally, and stories about Marie Redd and Evan Jenkins equally. Coders determined which category to place stories. If an article had references to both candidates, coders determined whether the majority of the article was about one candidate or the whether the story was equally about both candidates.

2) The length of stories measured in square inches

This category of the study is designed to show whether stories about Marie Redd are, on the average, longer or shorter than the stories about Tom Scott or Evan Jenkins. This measurement shows precisely if the two newspapers had a difference in the amount of space devoted to each candidate.

Because column width and typography of each newspaper varies during the research period, stories are measured in square inches. Headlines, white space, photographs, and cutlines also are included in the measurement.

Total inches are multiplied by .20 to allow for page reduction during the microfilming process.

3) Placement of stories

This category evaluates page placement of stories about Marie Redd, Tom Scott, and Evan Jenkins. Sub-categories include stories appearing on the newspapers' front page above the fold, front page below the fold, local front above the fold, local front below the fold, and pages other than front or local front. Stories were recorded on the coding sheet as (5) front page above the fold, (4) front page below the fold, (3) local page front above the fold, (2) local page front below the fold, and (1) pages other than front or local front.

4) Quantity of visual components

This category evaluates the total number of visual components, i.e. photographs and graphics, of Marie Redd, Tom Scott, and Evan Jenkins. Visual

components are measured in square inches to be included in the total length of stories measured in inches for each candidate. Cutlines also will be included in this measurement.

5) References to candidates' race

This category evaluates the frequency of references to the candidates' race.

6) References to candidates' gender

This category evaluates the frequency of references to the candidates' gender.

7) Tone of story

This category evaluates how each of the candidates is presented in the stories. Coders determined whether the story was positive, neutral, or negative in its tone. If an article had both negative and positive words, coders used their best judgment and recorded positive or negative in the appropriate space on the coding sheet. If negative and positive words were nearly equal in number, the story was coded as neutral. If a story was determined to be negative, it must have few or no positive words. If a story was determined to be positive, it must have few or no negative words.

8) Tone of visual components

This category evaluates how each of the candidates is presented in visual components, such as photographs and graphics, namely in a positive, neutral, or negative tone. Coders determined whether the visual component was positive, neutral, or negative in its tone. If a visual component had both negative and positive elements, coders used their best judgment and recorded positive or negative in the appropriate space on the coding sheet. If elements of the visual component were nearly equally negative and positive, the visual component was coded as neutral. If a visual component was determined to be negative, it must have few or no positive elements. If it a visual component was determined to be positive, it must have few or no negative elements.

Coding

For each sample, the researcher recorded the sample number, the publication's name, date of sample, placement of the sample, total number of square inches of each sample, total number of square inches of visual components, and whether there were references to each candidate's race, gender, and occupation.

Coders were trained and received coding instructions and coding sheets (See Appendix A, B). For each newspaper article, coders recorded whether the tone of the article was positive, neutral, or negative. Coders also determined in which category to place articles that include references to both candidates (i.e. a

story about Marie Redd containing a comment from Tom Scott was recorded in the number of stories about Marie Redd).

Three coders were selected for recording data. Because research involving race and gender can create an assumption of bias, the coders included at least one caucasian, and one African American. The coders included a graduate student, a university professor, and a newspaper editor.

To increase intercoder reliability, coders were trained using sample material and disagreements were analyzed as they occurred. A pilot study was conducted using a subsample of the content universe, which coders categorized. Intercoder reliability was calculated $3M / N1 + N2 + N3$ where M is the number of coding decisions on which the three coders agree, and $N1$, $N2$, and $N3$ are the total number of coding decisions by the first, second, and third coders respectively. Using this formula, the acceptable level of intercoder reliability was 90 percent.

Treatment of data

Once all articles and photographs were coded, the results were entered as variables into a statistical analysis program, the Statistical Package for the Social Science (See Appendix C). The data were evaluated as a whole and were broken down into campaign years, 1998 and 2002. The data were analyzed using data distribution and chi-square.

Descriptive statistics. Percentages and frequencies were used to describe the number of stories/photographs for each candidate; the tone of

stories/photographs for each candidate; the placement of stories for each candidate; the references to each candidate's gender, race, and occupation; the number of stories/photographs for each candidate by publication; the tone of stories/photographs for each candidate by publication; the placement of stories for each candidate by publication; the references to each candidate's gender, race, and occupation by publication.

Inferential statistics. Because all of the data was nominal, chi-square analysis with .05 probability was performed to determine any significant differences in category results and differences among the newspapers. The chi-square analysis indicated whether frequency differences occurred on the basis of chance, comparing observed frequencies with expected frequencies. Because of the small sample size, error messages occurred in some chi-square analysis with cells with expected frequencies less than 5.

CHAPTER IV

Results

Coverage of candidates

The data support the first hypothesis that Marie Redd received more coverage during the 1998 election campaign, as well as the fifth hypothesis that she received more coverage during the 2002 campaign (chi-square [$df = 4$] = 10.182).

As predicted, Marie Redd was featured in more news – five stories, or 274.34 square inches (50 percent), while Tom Scott was the subject of one story, or 145.47 square inches (21.43 percent), and one story, or 164.80 square inches (28.57 percent) is about both candidates.

The data show *The Herald-Dispatch* ran stories about Marie Redd in 66.67 percent of the stories about the Senate race, Tom Scott in 16.67 percent, and the two candidates in 16.67 percent. *The Charleston Gazette* featured Marie Redd in 37.50 percent of the stories, Tom Scott in 25 percent, and the two candidates in 37.50 percent.

In 2002, Marie Redd also received more coverage, with four stories, or 112.57 square inches (21.05 percent), compared to Evan Jenkins with three stories, or 46.29 square inches (15.79 percent), and stories equally about the two ranked highest at 12 stories, or 504.52 square inches (63.16 percent).

The data show Marie Redd received more coverage in 2002 in *The Herald-Dispatch*, 23.08 percent, but Redd and Jenkins received equal coverage in *The Charleston Gazette* with 16.67 percent of the stories. In 2002, stories

equally about the two candidates appeared in 61.54 percent of the cases in *The Herald-Dispatch* and 66.67 percent in *The Charleston Gazette*.

In 1998, Marie Redd also appeared in more visuals with five (71.43 percent). Tom Scott is shown in one visual, or 14.29 percent, and both candidates appear in one visual, or 14.29 percent.

When split into categories for each publication for that year, data show *The Herald-Dispatch* ran mostly visuals of Marie Redd (75 percent), some visuals of both candidates (25 percent), and no visuals of Tom Scott. *The Charleston Gazette* ran 66.67 percent visual of Marie Redd and 33.33 percent visuals of Tom Scott and no visuals of both.

In 2002, Marie Redd also appeared in more visuals with two, or 33.33 percent, while Evan Jenkins was shown in one visual, or 16.67 percent. The two candidates appeared three visuals, or 50 percent of the cases. *The Herald-Dispatch* ran visuals of the two candidates equally in 60 percent of the cases, and of each candidate individually in 20 percent. *The Charleston Gazette* ran visuals of Marie Redd in 100 percent of the cases.

Placement of stories

The data do not support the second hypothesis that Tom Scott received better story placement than Marie Redd, nor the sixth hypothesis that Evan Jenkins received better placement.

In 1998, the data show Tom Scott did not receive better story placement (chi-square [$df = 6$] = 6.421).

Placement of Story – 1998

Crosstab

Count		Subject of story			
		Marie Redd	Tom Scott	Equally Marie Redd and Tom Scott	Total
Placement of story	page other than front or local front	3	1	2	6
	local front/above fold	1		2	3
	front page/below fold	1	1		2
	front page/above fold	2	1		3
Total		7	3	4	14

In comparing story placement in the two newspapers for each candidate, the data show *The Herald-Dispatch* placed stories about Marie Redd in each of the categories 25 percent of the time. Stories about Tom Scott appeared on pages other than the front or local front in 100 percent of the cases. Stories about the two candidates appeared on the front page/above fold in 100 percent of the cases. In *The Charleston Gazette*, stories about Marie Redd appeared on the front page/above fold in 33.33 percent of the cases, and 66.67 percent on a page other than the front or local front. Stories about Tom Scott appeared on the front page/above fold and front page/below fold in 100 percent of the cases. Stories of the two candidates appeared on the local front/above fold in 33.33 percent of the cases and 66.67 percent on pages other than the front or local front.

Also, in 2002, neither candidate received better story placement when counting both papers (chi-square [$df = 6$] = 7.697).

Placement of Story – 2002

Crosstab

Count		Subject of story			
		Marie Redd	Evan Jenkins	Equally Marie Redd and Evan Jenkins	Total
Placement of story	page other than front or local front	3	2	4	9
	local front/above fold		1	1	2
	front page/below fold			3	3
	front page/above fold	1		4	5
Total		4	3	12	19

Still, in 2002 Marie Redd had better placement in *The Herald-Dispatch*, with stories on the front page/above fold in 33.33 percent of the cases and on pages other than the front or local front in 66.67 percent. Evan Jenkins had no stories appearing on the front page, but appeared on the local front/above fold in 50 percent of the cases and on pages other than the front or local front in 50 percent. Stories about the Redd and Jenkins appeared on the front page/above fold in 50 percent of the cases, on front page/below fold in 37.50 percent and on pages other than the front or local front in 12.5 percent. Also in 2002, *The Charleston Gazette* ran stories about each candidate on pages other than the front or local front in 100 percent of the cases. Stories about the two candidates equally appeared on the local front/above fold in 25 percent of the cases and on pages other than the front or local front in 75 percent.

Tone of story

The data do not support the fourth hypotheses that stories about Tom Scott had a more positive tone than stories about Marie Redd (chi-square [$df = 4$] = 6.927).

Tone of Story – 1998

Crosstab

Count		Subject of story			
		Marie Redd	Tom Scott	Equally Marie Redd and Tom Scott	Total
Tone of story	Positive	5		1	6
	Neutral	1	1	2	4
	Negative	1	2	1	4
Total		7	3	4	14

In 1998, Marie Redd has more stories with positive tone (71.43 percent), while Tom Scott has no positive stories and 66.67 percent negative stories compared to Marie Redd's 14.29 percent negative. Both had neutral stories – Redd (14.29 percent) and Scott (33.33 percent). Stories equally about the two candidates were 25 percent positive, 25 percent negative and 50 percent neutral.

When evaluated by each publication, the data show stories about Marie Redd were mostly positive in *The Herald-Dispatch* (75 percent) and some negative (25 percent). Stories about Tom Scott were negative in 100 percent of the cases and stories about the two candidates were positive in each case. *The Charleston Gazette* ran positive stories about Marie Redd (66.67 percent) as well as neutral (33.33 percent). Stories about Tom Scott were 50 percent negative

and 50 percent neutral. Stories featuring both candidates were neutral in most cases (66.67 percent) and also negative (33.33 percent).

Also, the data do not support the eighth hypothesis that stories about Evan Jenkins had a more positive tone than stories about Marie Redd.

Tone of Story – 2002

Crosstab

Count		Subject of story			
		Marie Redd	Evan Jenkins	Equally Marie Redd and Evan Jenkins	Total
Tone of story	Positive	4	3	1	8
	Neutral			9	9
	Negative			2	2
Total		4	3	12	19

In 2002, stories about each candidate were positive in 100 percent of the cases. Stories equally about Marie Redd and Evan Jenkins were positive (8.33 percent), neutral (75 percent), and negative (16.67 percent).

Stories of both candidates in *The Herald Dispatch* were positive (12.5 percent) and neutral (87.5 percent). Stories of both candidates in *The Charleston Gazette* were neutral (50 percent) and negative (50 percent).

References to candidates' race, gender, and occupation

The data support the third hypothesis claiming that newspapers referred to Marie Redd by race (chi-square [$df = 2$] = 7.191), but not by gender (chi-square

[*df* = 2] = 4.988) while referring to Tom Scott by occupation (chi-square [*df* = 2] = 2.706).

Reference to Marie Redd's Race – 1998

Crosstab

Count		Subject of story			
		Marie Redd	Tom Scott	Equally Marie Redd and Tom Scott	Total
Reference to Marie Redd's race	Yes	4			4
	No	3	3	4	10
Total		7	3	4	14

Reference to Marie Redd's Gender – 1998

Crosstab

Count		Subject of story			
		Marie Redd	Tom Scott	Equally Marie Redd and Tom Scott	Total
Reference to Marie Redd's gender	Yes	3			3
	No	4	3	4	11
Total		7	3	4	14

Reference to Tom Scott's Occupation – 1998

Crosstab

Count		Subject of story			
		Marie Redd	Tom Scott	Equally Marie Redd and Tom Scott	Total
Reference to Tom Scott's occupation	Yes			1	1
	No	7	3	3	13
Total		7	3	4	14

The data also do not support the seventh hypothesis, which claim newspapers referred to Marie Redd by race (chi-square [$df = 2$] = 5.600) and gender (chi-square [$df = 2$] = 3.078) while referring to Evan Jenkins by occupation.

Reference to Marie Redd's Race – 2002

Crosstab

Count		Subject of story			
		Marie Redd	Evan Jenkins	Equally Marie Redd and Evan Jenkins	Total
Reference to Marie Redd's race	Yes			5	5
	No	4	3	7	14
Total		4	3	12	19

Reference to Marie Redd's Gender – 2002

Crosstab

Count		Subject of story			
		Marie Redd	Evan Jenkins	Equally Marie Redd and Evan Jenkins	Total
Reference to Marie Redd's gender	Yes			3	3
	No	4	3	9	16
Total		4	3	12	19

While the newspapers used references to Marie Redd's race and gender in many instances during the 1998 campaign coverage, references were only made to Tom Scott's occupation in stories equally about the two candidates. The data show that no mention is made of Tom Scott's occupation in stories about Marie Redd or Tom Scott, but stories equally about both candidates make reference to his occupation in 25 percent of the cases.

The data for 1998 also show stories referenced Marie Redd's occupation in 85.71 percent of the cases, while not mentioning her occupation in stories about Tom Scott and only in 50 percent of the stories about both candidates.

While the data do not support the third hypothesis' claim of references to Tom Scott's occupation, they do make a strong case about references to Marie Redd's race and gender.

The data show stories about Marie Redd referenced her race in 57.14 percent of the cases, while no reference was made of her race in stories about Tom Scott or in stories about both of them. The data also show stories about Marie Redd made reference to her gender in 42.86 percent of the cases, while

no reference was made to her gender in stories about Tom Scott or in stories about both of them.

In the 2002 campaign coverage, the data show stories made reference to Evan Jenkins' occupation in 33.33 percent of the stories about him and in 41.67 of the stories about both candidates. However, no coverage makes reference to Marie Redd's occupation. The data show references were made to Marie Redd's race in 41.67 percent of the stories about her and Evan Jenkins and in no stories about either candidate individually.

References to Marie Redd's gender were made in 25 percent of the stories equally about both candidates and nowhere in stories about either candidate individually.

CHAPTER V

Discussion

This research project provides a much-needed window into how newspapers cover bi-racial elections. Surprisingly many of its findings are inconsistent with other studies and some areas may warrant additional research.

Because this study is limited to stories from *The Herald-Dispatch* and *The Charleston Gazette*, the sample size is small with only 33 stories. It is surprising how little coverage there was of the candidates in both elections. Research shows that media treatment of candidates is important to political campaigns; positive tone and amount of coverage have a positive impact on election outcomes (Freitag).

While the media coverage may have contributed to Redd's victory over Scott in 1998, another issue may have been Scott's stance on PEIA, West Virginia's public employees insurance plan. It was well known that Scott angered public school teachers and higher education professors when his orthopedic practice chose to not accept PEIA and, furthermore, when he spoke in a condescending tone to public employees during a public speech. Dave Peyton, a columnist for *The Herald-Dispatch*, wrote about the PEIA problem:

She (Redd) made the most of an obvious mistake by Scott. According to Scott, he's no longer with the group of orthopedic surgeons that still bears his name. In any event, the group doesn't accept patients who have state insurance. That infuriates public employees and teachers, whose numbers are legion. Scott says he has no decision-making power with the group and he still sees patients with state insurance in the limited practice he still maintains. But he was never able to overcome the stigma brought

on by the group's decision. Redd, on the other hand, was quick to point out what the Scott group was doing (Peyton).

Because of the PEIA dilemma, it could be argued that Redd's victory was really an anti-Scott vote. And in 2002, Redd's own stance on a much-debated issue – abortion – could have caused her own loss. Her pro-abortion stance was made very public just days before the primary as leaflets were distributed on cars outside Cabell County churches. Additionally, an advertisement appearing on May 9, 2002, in *The Charleston Gazette* indicated Redd, along with other legislators, would not support legislation to “protect unborn babies” if elected.

As predicted, this research found that Marie Redd received more coverage in each election campaign and that coverage of Redd is consistently higher than Tom Scott's coverage in each newspaper, *The Herald-Dispatch* and *The Charleston Gazette*. But in 2002, both candidates received equal coverage in *The Charleston Gazette*.

Remarkably, this study found stories about Marie Redd had a more positive tone than stories of Tom Scott. In fact, Tom Scott had no positive stories during the 1998 election campaign and more negative than neutral coverage. During the 2002 campaign, Evan Jenkins didn't receive more positive tone because he and Marie Redd each had 100 percent positive coverage. These findings are not consistent with previous analyses, and although positive, seem to follow the stereotypical selection-style reporting that Wilson and Gutierrez discuss. They suggest these types of “success stories” reassure whites that non-whites are still “in their place” and the non-whites who escape their designated place are not a threat to society because they manifest the same values and

ambitions as the dominant culture (Wilson, Gutierrez). An editorial in the March 3, 2002, *Charleston Gazette* suggests a similar idea, “They (whites) doubt that blacks care capable of attaining education and careers equal to whites. This ‘looking down’ upon blacks helps keep them in a second-class status.” Thus, it could be argued that this was a cultural bias simply reflected back to the public by the media.

Although other research indicates that white male candidates receive better story placement, this study found that neither Tom Scott nor Evan Jenkins received better placement than Marie Redd. In fact, stories about Tom Scott appeared on pages other than the front page or local front of both newspapers. Stories about Evan Jenkins only appeared on the local front or inside pages of *The Herald-Dispatch* and *The Charleston Gazette*. In both election years, about a fourth of the stories of Marie Redd appeared on the front page, while most of her stories appeared on inside pages.

Also unexpected was that coverage during both the 1998 and 2002 campaigns did not use race and gender to refer to Marie Redd and occupation for Tom Scott and Evan Jenkins as predicted. Powers and Serini suggest the media often are influenced by the personal characteristics of political candidates, i.e. research shows that Jesse Jackson was treated differently from other candidates partially because of his ethnic background. (Powers, Serini) And Terkildsen and Damore found that media nearly always accent the race of black candidates, but rarely, if ever, mention the race of white candidates (Terkildsen, Damore).

Zilber suggests the problems with this racialized coverage is that the typical media portray an African-American elected official as overly concerned with race, especially in a local context, and largely adrift in the legislative process (Zilber). More research could find if this type of coverage affected Marie Redd's re-election efforts.

Because the results of this study support some hypotheses while rejecting others, it would be beneficial to conduct a study with a larger sample (i.e. including more newspapers across the state of West Virginia) which may give more descriptive numbers about treatment of candidates in bi-racial elections. It also would be interesting to study how media coverage affected one or both of these elections.

Of course, one important limitation of this study is that it only analyzes coverage in newspapers. Television, radio, and increasingly, the Internet are other sources of news. Some researchers argue that voters learn more from newspaper reports than television reports. Still, future research could profit from contrasting messages with print and electronic news coverage.

Bibliography

- Action Replay, *Economist*, June1996, Vol. 339, Issue 7968, p25.
Retrieved Nov. 30, 2003, from EbscoHost.
- Atwater, Tony and Anokwa, Kwadwo. Race relations in EBONY. *Journal of Black Studies*, Mar91, Vol. 21 Issue 3, p268, 11p. Retrieved February 26, 2002, from EbscoHost.
- Baron, Stanley J. and Davis, Dennis K. *Mass Communication Theory – Foundations, Ferment, and Future*. Wadsworth, pp. 30-31.
- Barrett, L. and Kane, J.J. Race-Baiting Wins Again. *Time*. Nov1990, Vol. 136, Issue 22, p43. Retrieved Nov. 30, 2003, from EbscoHost.
- Biagi, Shirley and Kern-Foxworth, Marilyn (1997). *Facing Difference – Race, Gender, and Mass Media*. Pine Forge Press, p. 49.
- Clayton, Dewey M. and Stallings, Angela M. Black Women in Congress. *Journal of Black Studies*, Mar2000, Vol. 30 Issue 4, p574, 30p. Retrieved February 23, 2002 from EbscoHost.
- Clemons, Michael L. and Jones, Charles E. African American Legislative Politics in Virginia. *Journal of Black Studies*, Jul2000, Vol. 30 Issue 6, p744, 24p. Retrieved February 26, 2002 from EbscoHost.
- Clemons, Michael L. and Jones, Charles E. The Wilder vote and the New South phenomenon: A multivariate analysis. *Review of Black Political Economy*, Winter97, Vol. 25 Issue 3, p41, 16p. Retrieved February 26, 2002 from EbscoHost.
- Coates, Rodney D. Social Action, Radical Dialectics, and Popular Protests. *Journal of Black Studies*, Sep99, Vol. 30 Issue 1, p85. Retrieved Feb. 26, 2002, from EbscoHost.
- Cote, William and Fico, Frekrick. Fairness and Balance in Election Reporting. *Newspaper Research Journal*. Summer/Fall97, Vol. 18, Issue 3/4, p50, 14p. Retrieved Feb. 24, 2003, from EbscoHost.
- Dawson, Michael C. "Black Power in 1996 and the Demonization of African Americans." APSANET (American Political Science Association Online) www.apsanet.org/PS/sept96/dawson.cfm
- Domke, David. The Press and "Delusive Theories of Equality and Fraternity" in the Age of Emancipation. *Critical Studies in Mass Communication*, Sept96, Vol13 Issue 3, p228, 32p.

- Domke, David, and McCoy Kelley. News Media, Racial Perceptions and Political Cognition. *Communication Research*, Oct99, Vol. 26 Issue 5, p570, 38p. Retrieved March 1, 2003, from EbscoHost.
- Edsall, Thomas Byrne, and Edsall, Mary D. 1992. *Chain Reaction: The Impact of Race, Rights, and Taxes on American Politics*. New York: W. W. Norton.
- Fleras, Augie. Please Adjust Your Set: Media and Minorities in a Multicultural Society. Media Awareness Network. www.media-awareness.ca/eng/issues/minrep/resource/articles/augie.htm
- Franklin, Raymond S. 1991. *Shadows of Race and Class*. Minneapolis: University of Minnesota Press.
- Fraser, Nancy. What's Critical About Critical Theory? The Case of Habermas and Gender. *New German Critique*, Spring/Summer 1985, Issue35, pp. 97-131.
- Freitag, Alan R. An Analysis: New Hampshire Primary Coverage. *Newspaper Research Journal*. Summer2000, Vol. 21, Issue 3. Retrieved Feb. 24, 2003, from EbscoHost.
- Freundlieb, Dieter. Rethinking Critical Theory: Weaknesses and New Directions. *Constellations: An International Journal of Critical & Democratic Theory*; Mar2000, Vol. 7 Issue 1, p80, 20p. Retrieved June 27, 2003, from EbscoHost.
- Gallagher, Margaret. Reporting on Gender in Journalism – Why do so few women reach the top? *Nieman Reports*. Winter2001, pp63-65.
- Gerhardt, Uta. Worlds Come Apart: Systems Theory versus Critical Theory. Drama in the History of Sociology in the Twentieth Century. *American Sociologist*, Summer2002, Vol. 33 Issue 2, p5, 35p. Retrieved June 27, 2003, from EbscoHost.
- Gershenson, Dmitriy; Grossman, Herschel I. Civil Conflict. *Journal of Conflict Resolution*, Dec2000, Vol. 44 Issue 6, p808. Retrieved Feb. 22, 2002, from EbscoHost.
- Gorczyca, Beth. Interview, March 23, 2003.
- Graber, Doris. 1384. *Media Power in Politics*. CQ Press. Washington, D.C. pp. 139-186.
- Grube, G.M.A., translator (1974). *Plato's Republic*, Hackett Publishing Company.

- Halter, Marilyn (2000). *Shopping for Identity – The Marketing of Ethnicity*. Schocken Books, New York. pp. 170-191.
- Haynes, Audrey A.; Murray, Sarah G. "Why Do the News Media Cover Certain Candidates More Than Others?" *American Politics Quarterly*, Oct98, Vol. 26 Issue 4, p420, 19p. Retrieved March 1, 2003 from EbscoHost.
- Herzog, Hanna. More than a looking glass. *Harvard International Journal of Press/Politics*, Winter98, Vol. 3 Issue 1, p26, 21p. Retrieved February 26, 2002 from EbscoHost.
- Hudis, Peter. The Dialectical Structure of Marx's Concept of `Revolution in Permanence. *Capital & Class*, Spring2000 Issue 70, p127, 17p. Retrieved June 27, 2003, from EbscoHost.
- Jenkins, Evan. Huntington deserves a big slice of state pie. *The Herald-Dispatch*. March 6, 2002, p6A.
- Jewell, Malcolm E. State legislative elections. *American Politics Quarterly*, Oct94, Vol. 22 Issue 4, p483, 27p. Retrieved February 26, 2002 from EbscoHost.
- Journalism and Race: What Difference Does Diversity Make in the Newsroom? Unity: Journalists of Color. Unity Online. Feb. 21, 2003. www.unityjournalists.org/News/Presskit/race/race.html.
- Klotter, James C. The Black South and White Appalachia. *The Journal of American History*. March1980, Vol. 66, Issue 4, pp. 832-849. Retrieved Feb. 28, 2003, from JSTOR.
- Lee, Orville. Culture and Democratic Theory: Toward a Theory of Symbolic Democracy. *Constellations: An International Journal of Critical & Democratic Theory*, Dec98, Vol. 5 Issue 4, p433, 23p. Retrieved June 27, 2003, from EbscoHost.
- Livingstone, Rodney and Benton, Gregor (1975). *Karl Marx: Early Writings*. New York. Vintage Books, p. 209.
- Lublin, David and Voss, D. Stephen. Racial Redistricting and Realignment in Southern State Legislatures. *American Journal of Political Science*, Oct2000, Vol. 44 Issue 4, p792, 19p. Retrieved February 26, 2002, from EbscoHost.
- Marx, Karl and Engels, Friedrich (1984). *The Communist Manifesto*, Penquin Books.

- Number of female legislators grows, first black state senator gets elected. *The Charleston Gazette*. Nov. 5, 1998, p9A
- Off-year voter registration in Cabell County. *The Herald-Dispatch*. April 24, 2002, p6A.
- Peyton, Dave. Voters send a message by electing Regg, Egnor. *The Herald-Dispatch*. Nov. 6, 1998, p8A.
- Powers, Angela and Serini, Shirley. How Gender and Ethnicity Affected Primary Coverage. *Newspaper Research Journal*. Winter/Spring96, Vol. 17, Issue 1/2, p105, 8p. Retrieved Feb. 24, 2003, from EbscoHost.
- Salmons, Michael. Jenkins should have to pay to air wish list. *The Herald-Dispatch*. March 16, 2002, p8A.
- Santana, Maria Christina. "News Coverage of Hispanics Surpasses Expectations. *Newspaper Research Journal*, Spring2001, Vol. 22, Issue 2, p94, 11p. Retrieved Feb. 20, 2003, from EbscoHost.
- Stein, M. L. Racial Stereotyping and the Media. *Editor and Publisher*. Aug. 6, 1994, Vol. 127, Issue 32, p12, 2p. Retrieved Feb. 20, 2003, from EbscoHost.
- Simons, Jon. Ideology, imagology, and critical thought: the impoverishment of politics. *Journal of Political Ideologies*; Feb2000, Vol. 5 Issue 1, p81, 23p. Retrieved June 27, 2003, from EbscoHost.
- Terkildsen, Nayda and Damore, David F. The Dynamics of Racialized Media Coverage in Congressional Elections. *Journal of Politics*, Aug99, Vol. 61, Issue 3, p680. Retrieved Feb. 11, 2002, from EbscoHost.
- Unfair...Blacks are cheated. *The Charleston Gazette*. March 3, 2002, p2C.
- Valverde, Mariana. Identity Politics and the Law in the United States. *Feminist Studies*. Summer99, Vol. 25, Issue 2, p345. Retrieved Feb. 20, 2003, from EbscoHost.
- Williams, Walter. Demoralizing Young Blacks for the Empowerment of Black Leaders. *Capitalism Magazine*, 5 April 2001. www.capitalismmagazine.com/2001/april/ww_black.htm

Wilson II, Clint C. and Gutierrez, Felix (1995). *Race, Multiculturalism, and the Media – From Mass to Class Communication*. Second edition. SAGE Publications, pp. 156-157.

Wimmer, Roger D. and Dominick, Joseph R. (2000) *Mass Media Research, An Introduction*. Sixth edition. Wadsworth Publishing Company, pp. 134-159.

Yosso, Tara J. Critical Race Media Literacy. *Journal of Popular Film and Television*, Spring2002, Vol. 30, Issue 1, p52. Retrieved Feb. 20, 2003, from EbscoHost.

Zilber, Jeremy. Stereotypes in the News. *Harvard International Journal of Press/Politics*, Winter2000, Vol. 5 Issue 1, p32, 18p. Retrieved February 11, 2002, from EbscoHost.

Appendix A

Coding Instructions

For each sample you are receiving:

- A. Read each story individually and in its entirety.
- B. Complete one coding sheet for each sample.
- C. Code each story according to the categories listed and explained below.
- D. Include your initials at the bottom of the coding sheet.
- E. Return completed coding sheets and samples to the researcher.

Categories

1. Subject of story

Determine whether the story is about (a) Marie Redd, (b) Tom Scott, or (c) Evan Jenkins, or whether the story is equally about (d) Marie Redd and Tom Scott or (e) Marie Redd and Evan Jenkins. If an article has references to more than one candidate, determine whether the majority of the article is about one candidate and circle the candidate's name on the coding sheet. If the story is equally about two candidates, circle the appropriate category on the coding sheet.

2. Subject of visual component

If the sample contains a visual component determine whether the visual component is about (a) Marie Redd, (b) Tom Scott, or (c) Evan Jenkins, or whether the visual is equally about (d) Marie Redd and Tom Scott or (e) Marie Redd and Evan Jenkins. If a visual component shows or has references to more than one candidate, determine whether the majority of the visual component is about one candidate and circle the candidate's name on the coding sheet. If the visual component is equally about two candidates, circle the appropriate category on the coding sheet.

3. Tone of story

Determine whether the story is (a) positive, (b) neutral, or (c) negative in its tone. If an article has both negative and positive words, use your best judgment and circle positive or negative in the appropriate space on the coding sheet. If negative and positive words are nearly equal in number, code the article as neutral. If an article is determined to be negative, it must have few or no positive words. If it an article is determined to be positive, it must have few or no negative words.

4. Tone of visual component

Determine whether any visual component is (a) positive, (b) neutral, or (c) negative in its tone. If a visual component has both negative and positive elements, use your best judgment and circle positive or negative in the appropriate space on the coding sheet. If negative and positive elements are nearly equal in number, code the visual component as neutral. If a visual component is determined to be negative, it must have few or no positive elements. If it a visual component is determined to be positive, it must have few or no negative elements.

Appendix B

Coding Sheet

1. Subject of story:

- (a) Marie Redd (b) Tom Scott (c) Evan Jenkins
(d) Equally Marie Redd and Tom Scott
(e) Equally Marie Redd and Evan Jenkins

2. Subject of visual component:

- (a) Marie Redd (b) Tom Scott (c) Evan Jenkins
(d) Equally Marie Redd and Tom Scott
(e) Equally Marie Redd and Evan Jenkins

3. Tone of story:

- (a) Positive (b) Neutral (c) Negative

4. Tone of visual component:

- (a) Positive (b) Neutral (c) Negative

Coder initials _____

Categories to be completed by researcher:

Sample #: _____

Publication name: *The Herald-Dispatch* *The Charleston Gazette*

Date of sample: _____

Placement of story: 5 4 3 2 1

Total number of square inches for story: _____

Total number of square inches for visual component: _____

References to candidate's race: _____

References to candidate's gender: _____

Appendix C

Total dataset

<u>Variable</u>	<u>Description</u>
strysub	Subject of story 1 = Marie Redd 2 = Tom Scott 3 = Evan Jenkins 4 = Equally Marie Redd and Tom Scott 5 = Equally Marie Redd and Evan Jenkins
stymr1	Stories about Marie Redd in 1998 1 = Yes 2 = No
stymr2	Stories about Marie Redd in 2002 1 = Yes 2 = No
stryts	Stories about Tom Scott in 1998 1 = Yes 2 = No
stryej	Stories about Evan Jenkins in 2002 1 = Yes 2 = No
visubj	Subject of visual component 1 = Marie Redd 2 = Tom Scott 3 = Evan Jenkins 4 = Equally Marie Redd and Tom Scott 5 = Equally Marie Redd and Evan Jenkins
vismr1	Visual of Marie Redd in 1998 1 = Yes 2 = No
vismr2	Visual of Marie Redd in 2002 1 = Yes 2 = No
vists	Visual of Tom Scott in 1998 1 = Yes 2 = No
visej	Visual of Evan Jenkins in 2002 1 = Yes 2 = No
strytone	Tone of story 1 = Positive 2 = Neutral 3 = Negative

vistone	Tone of visual component 1 = Positive 2 = Neutral 3 = Negative
pubname	Name of publication 1 = <i>The Herald-Dispatch</i> 2 = <i>The Charleston Gazette</i>
pubdate	Date of story/visual component
plcmnt	Story/visual component placement on page 5 = front page/above fold 4 = front page/below fold 3 = local front/above fold 2 = local front/below fold 1 = page other than front or local front
stryinch	Total square inches of story
visinch	Total square inches of visual component
mrrace	Reference to Marie's Redd's race 1 = Yes 2 = No
tsrace	Reference to Tom Scott's race 1 = Yes 2 = No
ejrace	Reference to Evan Jenkins' race 1 = Yes 2 = No
mrgender	Reference to Marie's Redd's gender 1 = Yes 2 = No
tsgender	Reference to Tom Scott's gender 1 = Yes 2 = No
ejgender	Reference to Evan Jenkins' gender 1 = Yes 2 = No
mrocc	Reference to Marie's Redd's occupation 1 = Yes 2 = No
tsocc	Reference to Tom Scott's occupation 1 = Yes 2 = No
ejocc	Reference to Evan Jenkins' occupation 1 = Yes 2 = No

Dataset for 1998

<u>Variable</u>	<u>Description</u>
strysub	Subject of story 1 = Marie Redd 2 = Tom Scott
vissub	Subject of visual component 1 = Marie Redd 2 = Tom Scott 3 = No visual
strytone	Tone of story 1 = Positive 2 = Neutral 3 = Negative
vistone	Tone of visual component 1 = Positive 2 = Neutral 3 = Negative 4 = No visual
pubname	Name of publication 1 = The Herald-Dispatch 2 = The Charleston Gazette
plcment	Placement of story 5 = Front page/above fold 4 = Front page/below fold 3 = Local front/above fold 2 = Local front/below fold 1 = Pages other than front or local front
mrrace	Reference to Marie Redd's race 1 = Yes 2 = No
mrgender	Reference to Marie Redd's gender 1 = Yes 2 = No
tsrace	Reference to Tom Scott's race 1 = Yes 2 = No
tsgender	Reference to Tom Scott's gender 1 = Yes 2 = No

Dataset for 2002

<u>Variable</u>	<u>Description</u>
strysub	Subject of story 1 = Marie Redd 2 = Evan Jenkins
vissub	Subject of visual component 1 = Marie Redd 2 = Evan Jenkins 3 = No visual
strytone	Tone of story 1 = Positive 2 = Neutral 3 = Negative
vistone	Tone of visual component 1 = Positive 2 = Neutral 3 = Negative 4 = No visual
pubname	Name of publication 1 = The Herald-Dispatch 2 = The Charleston Gazette
plcment	Placement of story 5 = Front page/above fold 4 = Front page/below fold 3 = Local front/above fold 2 = Local front/below fold 1 = Pages other than front or local front
mrrace	Reference to Marie Redd's race 1 = Yes 2 = No
mrgender	Reference to Marie Redd's gender 1 = Yes 2 = No
ejrace	Reference to Evan Jenkins' race 1 = Yes 2 = No
ejgender	Reference to Evan Jenkins' gender 1 = Yes 2 = No