Benny Goodman: From “King of Swing” to Third Stream

Jae Ellis Bull

Follow this and additional works at: http://mds.marshall.edu/etd
Part of the Music Commons

Recommended Citation
Benny Goodman: From “King of Swing” to Third Stream.

Thesis submitted to
the Graduate College of
Marshall University
In partial fulfillment of
the requirements for the degree of
Master of Arts in Music.

by
Jae Ellis Bull

Dr. Vicki Stroher, Committee Chairperson
Dr. Marshall Onofrio,
Dr. Donald Williams

Marshall University
August 2006
ABSTRACT

Benny Goodman: From “King of Swing” to Third Stream.
By Jae Ellis Bull

Clarinetist and band leader Benny Goodman was born in the Chicago slums in 1909. He first played in dance bands and eventually organized his own band, which became so popular that he was known as the "King of Swing." As a clarinetist, he also was attracted to classical music, particularly the clarinet music of Mozart, Debussy and Brahms. Gunther Schuller, describing Goodman's ability to play in both jazz and classical styles said, "In a sense, Benny was the first Third Stream musician, moving easily in and out of jazz and classical music, from the Palomar Ballroom to Carnegie Hall..."\(^1\)

This paper explores Goodman's musical career in both the classical and jazz worlds, defines the term “Third Stream” and describes how Benny Goodman fits this term. Selected works Goodman explored as a classical clarinetist as well as some of the music written for and commissioned by him are discussed in detail.

ACKNOWLEDGMENTS

The author would like to thank her committee, Joe Petterson of the Jazz Studies Institute, Susanne Eggleton Lovejoy of Yale University, and everyone at Marshall University who has been patient and supportive. Thank you.

DEDICATION

The author wishes to dedicate this thesis to Jeri Ellis Platt, my mother, who begged a crying fourteen year old to ‘give this [music] one more year.’ Thank you for buying my first clarinet, my second clarinet, my first saxophone, my first flute, my third clarinet, my second saxophone, my second flute, my first oboe—you get the idea and to Lee Platt who sometimes dreams bigger dreams for me that I do (I haven’t been able to start that Clarinet Concerto, yet) and for listening to me expound on my limited knowledge of music history on those long car trips. I am truly blessed to have such parents.
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Section</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Abstract</td>
<td>ii</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Acknowledgments</td>
<td>iii</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Chapter I (Synopsis I: 1909-1935, Early Training Through the Jazz Stream)</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Chapter II (Synopsis II: Developing the Classical Stream)</td>
<td>13</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Chapter III (Synopsis III: Defining How Jazz and Classical Styles Unite in Third Stream)</td>
<td>21</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Conclusion</td>
<td>43</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Bibliography</td>
<td>45</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Appendix I (Summary of Recording Activity)</td>
<td>50</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Appendix II (Classical Recordings)</td>
<td>52</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Chapter I

Synopsis I: 1909-1935, Early Training Through the Jazz Stream.

Benny Goodman, the “King of Swing” was born the son of immigrant parents determined to provide a home for their children. The Goodman world was the Jewish ghetto of Chicago, on the West Side. The family was poor, living in a succession of basement apartments, some heated, some not. David Goodman earned twenty dollars a week at best and was occasionally out of work in bad seasons which resulted in a rather unstable life for his family. As each child became old enough, Dora Goodman encouraged him or her to work. The money brought in by the children began to ease the family’s constricting poverty. David Goodman was able to entertain the hope that some of the Goodman children might rise in the world. In his early autobiography, Kingdom of Swing, Benny Goodman related,

In the old country my mother had started to work when she was eight years old, and thought that we should start no later than thirteen or fourteen…On the other hand, Pop was always trying to get us to study, so that we would get ahead in the world. He always envied people with book-learning and education. Whatever any of us may have amounted to may be traced pretty much to him.²

On particular Sundays, his only day off, David Goodman took the youngest children, Benny included, to hear band concerts in Douglas Park. On one of those Sundays in 1919, David Goodman discovered a band of youngsters rehearsing in the Kehelah Jacob Synagogue and learned that any boys who joined would receive basic music lessons for a quarter. He insisted that his three youngest sons enroll as soon as possible. The boys of course joined.

Harry, age twelve, was given a tuba to play. Freddie, eleven, received a trumpet. Benny, only ten, required something a little lighter, so the bandmaster lent him a clarinet. Years later, Benny’s brothers said that he immediately embraced the instrument with its shiny keys as if it were a precious treasure. Reminiscing years later, Goodman states:

“There have been stories that I went for the clarinet in a big way because it had shiny keys and looked pretty. There might be something in that, but I know that if I had been twenty pounds heavier and two inches taller, I would probably be blowing a horn instead of a clarinet.”

The Kehelah Jacob band soon suspended operations because of financial difficulties, so the three brothers joined the band at Hull House. Organized by Jane Addams and Ellen Gates Starr in 1889, Hull House offered classes in dance, sketching, drama, and music. It was one attempt to overcome the “boy problem:” the program’s goals were to provide wholesome recreation and prepare young boys for some sort of occupation when they would have no other means. The Hull House band had been formed in 1907, but did not survive for long. When Goodman was eleven or twelve (1920-21), the band was reactivated under the leadership of James V. Sylvester. Also at Hull house at this time was bassist Milt Hinton, and pianist Art Hodes. Despite these three musicians’ eventual careers in jazz, jazz was not a part of the Hull House program.

The instruments that Goodman was given in both the Kehelah Jacob Synagogue band and at the Hull House used the “Albert” key system as opposed to the Boehm system. The latter has a more complex mechanism in order to make it easier to play in all keys. The Boehm system was widely used in the symphony orchestras during the earlier

---

3 Ibid., 21.
part of the century, although the Albert system lingered until after World War II. The Albert system continued to be used, even preferred, in marching bands and in dance bands until well into the 1920s, but died out in jazz and orchestras, with the exception of some of the older New Orleans musicians such as Edmond Hall and others. Goodman switched to the Boehm clarinet when he was about sixteen years old.

David Goodman seemed to believe, or at least hope, that music might someday become the boys’ escape route from the gritty world in which they lived. However, no musician could get very far without proper instruction. The person who, at the time, did the most to put young Benny Goodman on the right path was a German clarinetist and teacher, Franz Schoepp. Goodman’s brother Freddy later commented, “Benny was a natural, Schoepp gave him a foundation.” Schoepp concentrated on technique, steering Goodman through the standard lessons of Baermann, Klosé and Cavallini, and he believed that Goodman showed promise of becoming a fine clarinetist. Schoepp was a strict disciplinarian, never allowing a mistake to pass by. It is a characteristic that Goodman later embraced.

Also studying with Schoepp were black clarinetist Buster Bailey and Creole clarinetist Jimmie Noone. Both were older than Goodman by seven and fourteen years respectively, and from them Goodman learned, mostly by example, that jazz musicians must have a complete mastery of their instrument. Unfortunately, it was a goal that few jazz musicians of the time achieved.

---


7 Firestone, *Swing, Swing, Swing*.

8 Ibid., 25.
Goodman first heard popular jazz when his brother Louis brought home a second-hand Victrola which came with a number of records, among them one with a clarinet solo by Ted Lewis. Goodman was fascinated by the solo and listened to the record until he was able to imitate the whole performance note by note. By the time he was thirteen, Goodman began to play well-paid dance band jobs. Goodman at the time was a boy doing man’s work. Even decked out in a tuxedo provided by his sister Ethel, he was still a child and treated as one.

Between 1923 and 1924, Goodman began to socialize with a group of students from the West Side of Chicago, collectively known as “The Austin High Gang.” The group had started in the autumn of 1922 and included Jimmy and Dick McPartland, Bud Freeman, Frank Teschemacher and Jim Lanigan. They were joined later by pianist Dave North and drummer Dave Tough. They were a group of young jazz enthusiasts who are credited with developing “Chicago-style” jazz. The Austin High Gang were also middle class, gentile (except for Freeman who was half-Jewish) and more importantly, their families did not have to struggle to make a living. Goodman joined for a brief period of time mainly to play “hot music” or jazz, rather than the arranged dance ballads of popular tunes performed at most of his jobs.

By around 1925, Goodman found steady employment at Guyon’s Paradise in a dance band led by Jules Herbeveaux. The pay was forty eight dollars a week for four nights of work. Later he joined Arnold Johnson’s orchestra at a night club called Green Mills Gardens. When he was fifteen, Goodman moved to Art Kassel’s “Kassel’s in the...

---

9 Ibid., 30.
10 Collier, *Benny Goodman and the Swing Era*.
Air” orchestra at the Midway Gardens, a large and popular ballroom across from Washington Park. This job was step up for him.

Word got around about Goodman, and occasionally a musician from another orchestra would drop by to hear him play. One evening alto saxophonist and musical director of the Ben Pollack band, Gill Rodin, attended. The next morning, Rodin asked Goodman if he would like to join the band out in California. With no hesitation, Goodman said yes.\(^{11}\)

Ben Pollack was a drummer six years older than Goodman. At the age of nineteen, Pollack was playing with the New Orleans Rhythm Kings. Pollack had first heard Goodman when Goodman was a youth, still doing his Ted Lewis imitation. When Pollack heard him only a few years later, he was struck by his remarkable progress.\(^{12}\)

In 1926, shortly before his sixteenth birthday, Goodman packed a cardboard suitcase and bought his train ticket for California. Immediately on arrival Goodman found himself immersed in rehearsals. Although there was freedom in the group to improvise, Pollack expected that his band be rehearsed, correct in their playing and disciplined.

In May of the same year, Pollack brought the band back to Chicago, but at first bookings proved hard to find. To strengthen his rhythm section, Pollack took on Harry Goodman on tuba and string bass, and the band soon obtained the long-term engagement at the Southmoor Hotel. During the band’s engagement at the Southmoor David


\(^{12}\)Collier, *Benny Goodman and the Swing Era.*
Goodman was killed by a speeding car. A proud man, Goodman’s father never got the chance to hear him play because he was waiting until he could afford a nicer suit.

At the start of 1928, Pollack made a big move, this time to New York. It was also during this time that relations between “the two Bennys” (Pollack and Goodman) became strained. Pollack did not entirely approve of Goodman’s custom of recruiting members from the Pollack orchestra to cut free-lance records for small companies such as Banner, Oriole and Melotone. Eventually, their working relationship became strained and Goodman left the Pollack band.

Although Goodman had secured regular employment and had taken part in various recordings, the public still knew very little about him. He did find work, but not as often as he would have like. From the time that he left Pollack to the time that he received his own record deal in 1933, Goodman worked mainly as a freelance musician, trying to make a living entirely by playing in recording sessions. During some of these recording sessions he worked with cornetist Red Nichols and drummer Gene Krupa, also from Chicago. Through the years, Goodman would continue to work with his brother Harry and with Krupa, and many of the musicians he met through Ben Pollack, including Bud Freeman, Eddie Lang, Tommy and Jimmy Dorsey, Bix Beiderbecke, and his childhood idol Ted Lewis.

On a September evening in 1933, Benny Goodman met John Hammond. Hammond had been hired to produce a number of records for Columbia Records that would be sold in Europe and so approached Goodman about recording. At first Goodman said no, because the deal appeared to hold little if any profit. Many conversations later, Goodman changed his mind. The first recording session took place
on October 18, 1933. Ben Selvin of Columbia Records released the first two recordings in the United States where they sold well. During the next few months, Hammond helped to expand Goodman’s circle of jazz colleagues.

Like many musicians of the time, Goodman had an interest in putting together his own band. As a band leader he would make more money and have more control of the engagements. Goodman was aware that as a musician he was seen as difficult to work with in the studios, and as a result, was down to a forty-dollar a week radio show and perhaps one recording session a month. The music business was in a slump, but it was still possible to do well with the right kind of band. The bands led by Louis Armstrong, Duke Ellington, and Fletcher Henderson were very successful, broadcasting regularly and even making a few movies.

Goodman acquired some of the best instrumentalists in the area, many under contract with other bands. Each musician was promised the freedom to play jazz music and to solo a great deal if they desired. Billy Rose auditioned the group, and after a week or so, signed the band. For a short period of time, the engagement was a vacation from the infrequent sideman and recording gigs; however, after three months, the band was given notice.

Despite the failure at Billy Rose’s Music Hall, The Goodman Orchestra received a contract with the national Biscuit Company for a radio program broadcast by the National Broadcasting Company (NBC). Radio was an ever-present force in America at this time, so Goodman’s band was heard nationwide by millions of listeners. This was essentially the single most important break of Goodman’s career. As the popularity of
his band increased, Goodman’s reputation as a band leader and jazz clarinetist grew, eventually earning him the title “King of Swing.”

The Goodman band had been created to play “hot” music, or at least a swinging version of dance music. In particular, Goodman wanted good jazz players for his leads on first trumpet, first trombone, and first alto saxophone, so that the sections would really swing. As a rule, solos comprised no more than a quarter of each cut, although there were exceptions, particularly in the arrangements written by Fletcher Henderson. Goodman took more solo time than the others, although not much; on some of the recordings he gave Bunny Berigan long solos and did little soloing himself. As time went on, however, the sound of his clarinet tended to dominate the music.\(^{13}\)

Goodman practiced continually, and he wanted everyone else to bring the same dedication to music that he did. The band rehearsed twice a week; even when they were playing theaters, they would rehearse between shows. Goodman, typically, would take a whole three-hour rehearsal to learn a new tune. The band would play the tune through two or three times to get the notes, and then Goodman would edit it. He would mark up the parts, and then go over the phrasing, section by section. After that, he would have the band work on it without the rhythm section. A frequent term used at the time to describe the way Goodman’s band played was “on top of the beat,” meaning slightly ahead of, or with, the rhythm section.\(^{14}\)

Simultaneously, in July of 1935, Goodman recorded for the first time with a trio featuring drummer Gene Krupa and black pianist Teddy Wilson. Daring for the time, Goodman, at John Hammond’s request, began to appear live with the interracial group.

\(^{13}\) Ibid., 13

\(^{14}\) Ibid., 13.
There had been no black members in the Goodman band, as it was the norm to segregate musicians and bands along racial lines.

At this time (and for many years afterwards), Goodman’s orchestra relied on the arrangements of Fletcher and Horace Henderson. Fletcher Henderson was himself a successful band leader and jazz pianist and black. In the same months that the Goodman Trio was launching its first recordings and performances, other recordings were being made with Billy Holiday and the full Benny Goodman orchestra. At the end of the year, the jazz journal *Metronome* rated the Goodman orchestra “The best swing band of 1935.” At the time of this recognition, the orchestra settled into Chicago for a long engagement at the Congress Hotel.

Also in 1935 was Goodman’s performance of W.A. Mozart’s *Quintet for Clarinet and Strings in A-Major* at musicale in the ballroom of John Hammond’s mother’s house. Since his early training had been quite solid, Goodman knew the classical clarinet repertory even though he concentrated on jazz. Goodman’s involvement with classical music, both the older works he studied and the works he commissioned, will be addressed in Chapter Two.

It was also through John Hammond that Goodman discovered vibraphonist Lionel Hampton. Hampton was working at a somewhat seedy, sailor’s dive in downtown Los Angeles, ironically called “Paradise.” After paying the ten cent entrance fee, Goodman watched as Hampton worked as the master of ceremonies, bandleader and star performer. Goodman returned the next night with Gene Krupa and Teddy Wilson. The men ended the evening with an impromptu jam session. The Goodman Quartet made its first
recording on August 21, 1936. Hampton agreed to join the Goodman organization after his contract at the Paradise was finished.

It perhaps was Goodman’s greatest wish to end the cycle of long hours and one night engagements for his band and find a more permanent gig. The band’s tour through parts of the Midwest and the Rockies produced very little notice and many appearances if the band proved discouraging. So, it was not surprising that MCA considered canceling the last engagement, a full month at the prestigious Palomar Ballroom in Los Angeles, remained. The success at the Palomar became a part of jazz history as the initial one month engagement became two and the band’s popularity soared.

In March 1937, at the Paramount Theater in New York, the growing admiration for the band reached a climax. At this time Goodman’s band was playing the Manhattan Room of the Hotel Pennsylvania, which had become the most popular music room in New York with the college crowd. Goodman assumed that the job would be routine. Movie theater audiences in the past had proved to be unresponsive to swing. The film taking the other half of the bill was Maid of Salem, a grave movie about witch craft in New England, starring Claudette Colbert and Fred MacMurray. On the first morning, when Goodman and the band arrived at the theater for the 7:00 am rehearsals, they found a line already formed at the box-office and stretching around the block. Goodman realized that these were thousands of brand-new Goodman fans who were not part of the night-club scene and who could pull together the thirty-five cents for a theater ticket.

The band performed five times a day at the unprecedented show, and attendance topped twenty-one thousand day after day. However, the most revolutionary concert of Goodman’s whole career took place on the evening of January 16, 1938 at Carnegie Hall
in New York. What the Goodman band established or at least helped introduce in that Carnegie Hall performance was the idea of a jazz concert. Until then, jazz orchestras of one type or another had merely provided music for dancing. The idea of asking people to buy tickets for seats in a concert hall and provide them with anything but classical music had not occurred before. This was not, however, the first concert feature an established jazz group. The composer James Reese Europe (1881-1919) and his Orchestra performed there on May 2, 1912, again in 1913 and 1914.\textsuperscript{15} Goodman’s orchestra was the first integrated jazz orchestra to play to a white audience.

The Goodman band probably had reached its potential and its personnel were stronger than ever before or afterwards that night. There had been many personnel changes in the Goodman orchestra, and there were to be more. Not many jazz bands could keep the same members together for long periods of time. Goodman selected musicians of great quality for his bands, but he never managed to keep the best musicians in his band for long. Rival bandleaders were ready to pay much more for the services of another band’s star performer. Also, it was inevitable that the best men in a group were to start bands of their own. Gene Krupa, Lionel Hampton, and Harry James would follow this route, forming rather successful groups of their own. Despite the constant shifting of members and conflicts between band members, particularly Krupa and Goodman, the band continued to thrive.

Unfortunately, the Swing Era did not last long and Goodman’s status as its king would diminish. A new style of music called Bebop would emerge challenging Swing’s supremacy in jazz music. Goodman ventured into this new style but the combination did

not suit him. Other musicians would find both failure and immense success at this new style while such musicians as Louis Armstrong would speak against it. With the emergence of Bebop and the decline of Swing, Goodman was not able to form another successful orchestra, but did find continued success with his smaller jazz trios and quartets. Bebop flourished from the mid 1940s into the 1950s, when other styles such as Cool Jazz, Rock and Roll, and Soul would take over the music scene.

In 1953, Goodman invited Louis Armstrong to participate in a tour of the United States. The timing was ideal because Goodman’s and Armstrong’s old records were being re-released and were selling well. For the tour Goodman collected a band that consisted almost entirely of old friends, including Gene Krupa, who had left to form his own band after various disagreements with Goodman. The tour opened in Boston and went to New York.

This tour was just one of many opportunities for Goodman to play with musicians who were considered his equal, if not better. Not only was he recognized for his music, but he also took part in other media such as films or popular movies of the day. Especially during the 1930s and 1940s when swing was the most popular form of music, Goodman’s face was one of the most recognized in the country.
Chapter II
Synopsis II: Developing the Classical Stream.

Benny Goodman’s interest in the classical repertoire dates to his early training with Franz Schoepp at Chicago’s Hull House around 1919. It was a tremendous stroke of luck for Goodman to receive instruction from such a prestigious teacher and clarinetist. It is believed that Schoepp accepted Goodman as a student because he was already showing promise as a clarinetist. Schoepp provided Goodman with a firm technique, which involved a proper embouchure, correct fingering, and the right way to tongue and support the sound. Goodman was studying these classical foundations with Schoepp while playing jazz in public.

Goodman is different from many jazz musicians of the early twentieth century because most others were self-taught. For much of his career, the fact that Goodman could actually read music while most jazz musicians merely memorized popular tunes set him apart. During the two years that he studied with Schoepp, Goodman played classical etudes and perhaps classical solos. Although his career through the late 1920s and most of the 1930s did not permit much attention to this repertoire, he never completely ignored the genre.

Late in 1935 Goodman played W.A. Mozart’s Clarinet Quintet, K. 581 at a house party at the home of John Hammond’s mother, an occasion which Hammond recalls as being the first time Goodman played a classical piece before an audience. This
performance marks the beginning of a career in both classical and jazz music, although his role as a jazz musician and band leader would always be at the forefront. John Hammond in his autobiography, *John Hammond on Record*, wrote the following:

> It had been my idea to expand Benny’s career to include performances of classical music, and I believe now it was one of the worst ideas I ever had. I had visions of bridging the gulf between classical music and jazz, which I thought would be important to jazz. The combination of Goodman and Mozart seemed a fine idea. I cannot, however, take all the credit or all the blame for bringing Benny to classical music. He has always had an urge to do more than improvise jazz…I believe he could handle two musical lives independently of each other, but in looking back I think I was unfair to him. It is almost impossible for anybody, much less the most successful bandleader in the country, to handle successfully two completely different approaches to music.\(^\text{16}\)

As Goodman continued to perform classical music, jazz and classical music critics expressed diverse opinions. Critics from both areas generally would be polite; jazz critics would go further and support and praise these performances, wishing to show that not only is jazz respectable, but also that classical music can be played well by a jazz musician. *Cleveland Plain Dealer* reviewer Herbert Elwell apparently was surprised that a jazz musician could play classical music, allowing “One could look in vain for evidence of anything but the most well-behaved musicianship. In fact, his playing was on the restrained side. A little too refined to have much character, it pleased by technically brilliant passage work, smooth legato and an even quality of tone.”\(^\text{17}\)

Speaking about his earliest forays into classical music, Goodman allowed, [I] “just plunged in.”\(^\text{18}\) Essentially, he approached this classical repertoire the same way he

---


18 Goodman and Kolodin, *Kingdom of Swing*. 
would have prepared a popular jazz chart: little practice was necessary if he knew the “tune.” It was an approach that initially failed him, particularly when he went to record the Mozart Quintet with members of a professional group. For this recording session Goodman had done no preparation, and further, the members from the Pro Arte chamber orchestra spoke French and very little English, making communication difficult. This project failed and Goodman was so embarrassed that years later the incident would show up in various articles that he would write in reference to his earliest attempts at classical music—perhaps to show how much he had improved since then. Goodman related in an article that he wrote for the University of Chicago:

Looking back I can’t imagine why I agreed on such a short notice, because my attitude about classical music was quite serious, well, whatever the reason, here is what happened: Not only had Pro Arte and I been unable to rehearse, but I had played with my band the night before someplace in Wisconsin and when the date was over, we all piled into a bus, drove through the night and arrived in Chicago at 6:00 AM. Four hours later I walked into the recording studio, met the Pro Arte String Quartet for the first time…I then sat down, took out my clarinet and plunged right into the Mozart Quintet. A few bars later, I realized, with horror, that I was totally unprepared and fled from the studio. After that I did some serious thinking.19

On January 18, 1938, two days after the famous Carnegie Hall jazz concert, Goodman played the same Mozart Quintet on the “Camel Caravan” radio show. The broadcast went well enough to encourage Goodman to try recording the Quintet again three months later with the Budapest String Quartet, a far better group. Goodman prepared beforehand, and the performance was without a doubt better, but again it was not particularly good and did not hold up to Goodman’s high standards of playing and performance. After he made the recording with the Budapest String Quartet, Goodman was asked why he took up classical music, his answer was simple: “I wanted something

19 Benny Goodman, “University of Chicago” (Connecticut: Yale University Archives).
No jazz musician had previously appeared publicly as a classical soloist, and his playing received mixed reviews, even from critics who were favorable towards jazz.

In early 1938 after the release of the Mozart Quintet recordings with the Budapest String Quintet, English composer and early jazz critic Patrick Hughes set the tone of the overall criticism of Goodman’s classical playing when he wrote, “As a player of Mozart he had not yet developed a personality. There is nothing in his playing individual enough to make the listener say the next time he hears a Goodman recording: That is Benny, of course….Taking the performances as a whole, Goodman’s share is frankly undistinguished.”

Rudolph Dunbar, an English clarinetist, wrote, “I feel that he is not at ease in his “new” music—he is feeling his way too much, a little awed by it all.”

Goodman, in fact agreed with the critics: “What’s wrong with that set of records is Goodman. I was still reading notes and that’s the only part of the discipline. If I were to do it over now (two years later) it would be ten times as good. And I mean ten.”

When Goodman performed the Mozart Clarinet Concerto in Carnegie Hall that same year, however, The New York Times critic wrote, “Mr. Goodman…approached the Mozart rather warily but in most self-effacing manner. Its most difficult passages were not met with utmost ease and accuracy. The phrasing was impeccable, the legato of the smoothest. As for the tone produced, it was somewhat open to question….Many of the pages would have benefited from a suaver and more refined tone.”

---

20 Chi, “Not Just The King of Swing,” 65.
22 Ibid.
23 Sunday PM, 8 Dec. 1940.
24 Ibid.
continue to both praise and censure Goodman as he continued performing classical works, eventually causing him to seek out a teacher to develop his classical style and refine his tone. Goodman would go one step further and commission classical works to perform with well-known composers and musicians.

On January 9, 1939, Goodman took part in a Carnegie Hall recital by violinist Joseph Szigeti, playing the premiere performance of the *Rhapsody for Clarinet and Violin* by Hungarian composer Bela Bartók, a chamber piece for clarinet, violin and piano that Szigeti had commissioned. The *Rhapsody* was an earlier composition that Bartók reworked to fit Szigeti’s criteria. Later re-titled *Contrasts*, it is the first of many classical compositions for clarinet that Goodman learned and performed. In the years to come there were numerous others, including Paul Hindemith’s *Concerto for Clarinet and Orchestra* (1947), Aaron Copland’s *Concerto for Clarinet* (1947), Leonard Bernstein’s *Prelude, Fugues and Riffs* for solo clarinet and jazz ensemble (1949) and Morton Gould’s *Derivation for Clarinet and Band* (1956). Though Goodman was concerned primarily with generating new repertoire for himself, the net result was an expansion of the body of available clarinet literature.

Between the debut of the Bartók in January 1939 and the time he recorded it sixteen months later, Goodman’s involvement with classical music continued to deepen. On December 12, 1940, Goodman appeared at Carnegie Hall as a soloist with the full New York Philharmonic to play the Mozart *Concerto* and Claude Debussy’s *Premier Rhapsody for Clarinet*. *The New York Times* review found that although Goodman approached the Mozart “rather warily” and moved through the Debussy with “greater freedom,” he met the compositions most difficult passages with “the utmost ease and
accuracy.” The review further states that “the sounds of his clarinet often overbalanced the correctly discreet orchestral support his phrasing was “impeccable,” his legato “the smoothest.”

Given Goodman’s limited background in classical music, he made this transition to the concert hall with remarkable ease. Nevertheless, he eventually realized that it would take years of additional experience to develop the confidence and mastery he already had with jazz. Prompted by a love for the classical clarinet, in the late 1940s Goodman completely changed his approach to playing the clarinet. One aspect of this change was the introduction of the totally different double-lip embouchure.

Goodman’s use of the double-lip embouchure was influenced by Reginald Kell, with whom Goodman studied, beginning in 1949. Kell was an Englishman who came to the United States as a virtuoso clarinet player and had worked in symphony orchestras. Learning to use the double-lip technique brought a different set of facial muscles into play. Goodman also changed his fingering technique. According to Time Magazine, “Goodman had his old finger calluses removed by a doctor, and then began, at age forty, relearning his life’s work; he developed an even, more controlled playing technique.”

In 1948, Goodman gave the first performance, accompanied by the NBC Symphony, of a new concerto for clarinet and orchestra that he commissioned from Aaron Copland. He also played another new concerto, commissioned from Paul

---

25 Chi, “Not Just The King of Swing.”

26 Playing classical clarinet is quite different from playing jazz on the instrument. Classical clarinet players tend to use mouthpieces that have a small opening between the reed and the mouthpiece for better control. Jazz clarinet players use mouthpieces with a wider opening, which allows them to accent notes more easily.

27 Most clarinetists curl their lower lip over their teeth and rest the clarinet on it; the upper lip remains in its normal position, so that the teeth are actually touching the mouthpiece. In the double-lip system, both lips are curled over the teeth; this is supposed to open up the throat and encourage lighter tonguing.

28 Chi, “Not Just The King of Swing.”
Hindemith, with the Philadelphia Orchestra. Goodman’s enthusiasm about playing with Reginald Kell led him in the summer of 1950 to commission a concerto for two clarinets from the young Swedish-American composer Ingolf Dahl. After the piece was still in its first drafts, Goodman asked Kell to play one of the parts: “He’d play his part straight, and I’d jazz mine up a little.”

Jim Maher, who was one of Kell’s amateur students, recalls that when he heard the two of them rehearse the preliminary draft of the piece, “Kell sounded so good and Benny sounded so stiff,” without any of the looseness he had in his jazz playing. Unfortunately, this double concerto was never finished.

The two-and-a-half years Goodman studied with Kell did improve his interpretive abilities, and extended the life of Goodman’s career. As he got older he would not have been able to sustain the kind of technique he had as a young man. His embouchure would have weakened because he was not playing the most efficient way. As he began to acquire proper technique from Kell, his studies helped him sustain the musculature he was using over a long period of time.

Most modern criticism reflects a negative opinion of Goodman’s classical playing. According to critic Terry Teachout, Goodman played classical music: like a self-made man whose table manners have been painstakingly learned from a book on etiquette. His 1939 recording of the Mozart Clarinet Quintet is fluent and correct but pallid on tone, and his phrasing in the slow movement is stiffly four-square…Goodman never learned to play classical literature idiomatically, and his recorded performances are for the most part tasteful but dull. (An exception is the second recording of Copland’s lovely Clarinet Concerto, whose cadenza and second movement have a jazzy flavor). His chief contribution to classical music was not as a performer but as an enlightened patron: the pieces he

29 *Time*, 4 Dec. 1939, 94.
30 Firestone, *Swing, Swing, Swing*.
31 Ibid., 360.
commissioned from Copland, Hindemith, and other twentieth century composers now form the cornerstone of the modern clarinet repertoire.\textsuperscript{32}

Goodman could very well be the first famous jazz musician to achieve success performing classical music. His jazz clarinet sound was modeled and admired while his classical sound was scrutinized and picked apart. Recordings of both jazz and classical works exhibit his almost flawless technique and control, but also clearly show Goodman’s lack of tonal focus, a technique not always utilized or wanted in jazz music. Goodman was first and foremost a musician. He was crucial to the development of many of the great musicians and music of the early swing era. Without Goodman, the classical repertoire would not have some of its greatest clarinet works: both classical and jazz musicians are greatly in his debt.

\textsuperscript{32} Ibid., 65.
CHAPTER III


The fact remains that for many years millions of people identified instantly with the sound of his clarinet. These particular and unique technical characteristics of Goodman’s clarinet playing, of course, also account for his ability to play classical music without embarrassment and without the need to “switch” techniques. And let us not minimize the importance of Goodman’s role in classical music, if only because he commissioned and caused to be written a classic of the twentieth-century literature, Béla Bartók’s *Contrasts*. In a sense, Benny was the first Third Stream musician, moving easily in and out of jazz and classical music. 33

This statement will serve a central role in defining Third Stream as well as describing how Benny Goodman is a Third Stream musician.

America, particularly around the end of World War I, made a substantial contribution to the musical canon with the emergence of jazz. Spread throughout the country by recordings, *improvised* jazz was America’s first successful musical export. Up to the point, America had been more like a sponge, soaking up developments in Western Europe and further abroad and emulating them. Jazz was the first viable challenge to the supremacy of Europe’s notation-based classical music. Its rhythmic

vitality and freedom of interpretation were immediately recognized as a contrast to traditional European music.

Many American and European classical composers attempted to reconcile the seemingly opposed aesthetics of jazz and the classics by incorporating jazz rhythms and timbres into their compositions. Jazz pioneers from Duke Ellington to Charles Mingus created large-scale works that included classical elements, while classical composers such as George Gershwin (1898-1937) and Darius Milhaud (1892-1974) sought to incorporate jazz elements into their compositions.

Of his *La Création du monde (The Creation of the World)*, Milhaud would later claim:

> At last in *La Création du monde* I had the opportunity I had been waiting for to use those elements of jazz to which I had devoted so much study. I adopted the same orchestra as used in Harlem, seventeen solo instruments, and I made wholesale use of the jazz style to convey a purely classical feeling.  

As illustrated in Table I below, it is a highly successful blend of jazz and classical elements (including a properly developed fugue). *La Création du monde* seems to have gotten jazz out of Milhaud’s system, for in 1926 he was able to announce to American journalists that jazz no longer interested him.

**Table 1: Jazz and Classical Elements in *La Création du monde*.**

| Instrumentation | Flute (2), oboe, clarinet (2), bassoon, horn, trumpet (2), trombone, piano, timpani (3), small timpani (2), pedal bass drum, drum with cymbal, snare drum, tenor drum, tambourine (narrow two-headed drum with or without snares), metal block, woodblock, suspended cymbal, solo violin (2), E-flat Alto saxophone, cello, and double bass |

---


35 The saxophone replaces the viola in the traditional string quartet (two violins, viol, and cello). It is a substitution that works because of the comparable range and the mellow tone of both instruments.
Jazz Influence
Syncopation; fluctuation between major and minor thirds (Blues); melodic/harmonic style; twelve-bar blues pattern; blues notes; statement of an improvised jazz solo (clarinet/trumpet)

Classical Influence
Instrumentation; form [overture, fugue, Ternary form (A-A-B)]; use of motives

Milhaud became interested in jazz after hearing it in London in 1920. In 1922 he embarked on a tour of America, during which he was a regular at Harlem jazz clubs and gathered a collection of records to take back with him to Europe. Upon returning to Paris in 1923, he composed the ballet *La Création du monde*. 36

It should be noted that Milhaud wrote jazz-inspired music more than created an authentic jazz sound; the fugue subject draws on jazz styles, but the closely spaced imitative entries in the trombone, saxophone and trumpet reflect classical writing. 37

George Gershwin invented a unique symphonic style with his *Blue Monday* (1922) and *Rhapsody in Blue* (1924). *Rhapsody in Blue* was, of course, not the first to blend jazz and classical music, but it is perhaps the most well known work to do so. One could also make cases for Claude Debussy, Scott Joplin, or Milhaud as important pioneers and even better, as creators of masterworks which used jazz. All of them, however, had exploited jazz’s “chamber” qualities. 38 It is with *Rhapsody in Blue* that the term “symphonic jazz” 39 is finally appropriate. *Symphonic jazz* is a term coined in the 1920s partly in connection with attempts to fuse jazz with classical forms. Some of these

---

endeavors were sponsored by band leader Paul Whiteman. The term is a predecessor of the term “Third Stream” which will be discussed more later.

Gershwin composed *Rhapsody in Blue* between December 1923 and late January 1924. The premiere took place in New York’s Aeolian Hall on February 12, 1924 with Paul Whiteman and his dance band orchestra accompanying Gershwin as the piano soloist. The original score was prepared by Ferde Grofé for Whiteman’s expanded orchestra as illustrated below in Table 2. *Rhapsody in Blue* was the result of an invitation to Gershwin extended by Paul Whitman, leader of a prominent and highly successful dance orchestra, sometime after November 1, 1923. Whiteman requested from the composer something that could be included in a concert illustrating the growth of jazz, which he was planning for an indefinite date in the future. The announced purpose of Whiteman’s concert was to demonstrate how jazz had developed since it first appeared, but the real goal was to feature the Paul Whiteman orchestra, capitalizing on the group’s recent and highly successful tour to London. Whiteman’s musical reputation relied on skilled arrangements of popular dance tunes designed for his own players much more than for the spontaneity of jazz. The program itself hardly addressed those stated goals. The orchestra presented a variety of popular tunes in various styles, all of which began to sound much alike. *Rhapsody in Blue* was the penultimate number on the program, and by all accounts the performance save the day at the same time that it launched Gershwin’s national reputation as composer and pianist.  

---

40 Schiff, *Gershwin: Rhapsody in Blue*, 1-3.
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Instrumentation</th>
<th>Three reed players; 42 heckelphone; trumpets/flugelhorns (2); horn (2); trombone (2)/euphonium/bass trombone; tuba/string bass; timpani; set of traps; banjo; two pianos; violins (8); solo piano</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Jazz Influence</td>
<td>Use of banjo; woodwind doubling; rhythm; vamp figures in accompaniment; jazz sonorities; glissando(s)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Classical Influence</td>
<td>Continuous form; solo piano (Concerto): thematic material</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Although the label “symphonic jazz” often is confined to such “classical” composers as Gershwin, the principles behind the term can encompass a larger repertory to include the compositions of jazz composers such as Edward “Duke” Ellington. Ellington was fully aware of classical music and the endeavors of his fellow composers. In many of his own compositions he stepped outside the normal time limits and functional purposes of much early jazz with such multi-sectional works as Creole Rhapsody (1931), Reminiscing in Tempo (1935), and a number of other pieces. 43

Composer and critic Gunther Schuller took note of this melding of jazz and classical influences and coined the term Third Stream. 44 It is a term that he applied to many compositions, musicians and composers, including Benny Goodman. The term Third Stream encompasses a type of music which, through improvisation or written

---

41 Lee, Masterworks of Twentieth Century Music.
42 Reed players were required to double on flute, oboe, E-flat soprano clarinet, B-flat clarinet, alto and bass clarinets, soprano, alto, tenor, and baritone saxophone.
composition or both, fuses the essential characteristics and techniques of contemporary Western art music and other musical traditions. At the heart of this concept is the notion that any music stands to benefit from a blending with another; thus composers of Western art music can learn a great deal from the rhythmic vitality and swing jazz, while jazz musicians can find new avenues of development in the large-scale forms and complex tonal systems of classical music.

Schuller originally applied the term to a style in which attempts were made to fuse basic elements of jazz and Western art music—the two mainstreams joining to form a “Third Stream.” This style had been in existence for some years at the time of Schuller’s observation. Since the late 1950s the use of the term had broadened to encompass fusions of classical music with elements drawn not only from African-American sources but also from other vernacular traditions, including Turkish, Greek, Hindustani, Russian and Cuban music, among others. The third-stream movement attracted much controversy and often has been allied incorrectly with the symphonic jazz movement of the 1920s. Symphonic jazz, à la Gershwin, lacked the essential element of improvisation. Third Stream, like all musical syntheses, is exposed to the risk of superficially imposing stylistic characteristics on an established musical idiom. Genuine merging has occurred only in the work of musicians deeply rooted in both traditions.

*Third Stream* signifies a “fusion.” In Schuller’s application, classical fuses with jazz to produce a new and “third” stream. Elements that are common to jazz music and other elements common to classical music merge in a single composition, and a true mixture of jazz and classical elements should be present. Elements that Third Stream shares with jazz are the harmonic structure, rhythmic elements and even improvised
sections. From classical practice, Third Stream takes a more formalized structure, a different sense of balance and orchestration.

Schuller maintains, however, that there is no such thing as “Third Stream jazz.” He argues:

Third Stream is not jazz with strings, it is not jazz played on ‘classical’ instruments, it is not classical music played by jazz players, it is not inserting a bit of Ravel or Schoenberg between be-bop changes-nor the reverse. It is not designed to do away with jazz or classical music; it is just another option amongst many for today’s creative musicians…by definition there is no such thing as ‘Third Stream Jazz.’

Thus, in Schuller’s interpretation, Benny Goodman’s interest in classical music did not by itself make him a Third Stream musician. It was the addition of the classical repertoire to his already extensive jazz repertoire, as well as the commissioning of newer works, the contributed to this phenomenon. Applying Schuller’s interpretation, Benny Goodman is not a Third Stream musician because he could play both jazz and classical music. He is not Third Stream because he studied classical music or performed classical and jazz music in public. He is Third Stream because he was capable of “stylistic flexibility,” essentially being able to play in the two styles (jazz and classical) successfully.

To clarify how Goodman was able to accomplish stylistic flexibility, the following compositions will be discussed in detail” Béla Bartók’s Contrasts, Aaron Copland’s Clarinet Concerto, Paul Hindemith’s clarinet Sonata, Francis Poulenc’s Sonata for Clarinet and Piano, Igor Stravinsky’s Ebony Concert, and Leonard Bernstein’s Prelude, Fugues and Riffs. The Bartók, Copland and Poulenc all have been accepted into the standard classical clarinet repertoire while the Stravinsky and Bernstein

45 Ibid., 120.
have been accepted as jazz compositions. The Hindemith *Concerto* is not an example of Third Stream but serves as an example of the type of literature being written for Goodman. Each work, excluding the Hindemith, will be studied as a Third Stream composition with careful consideration of how classical and jazz elements are “fused.” The parameters used to study each composition must be defined: various stylistic characteristics from each area must be present. An equal balance of classical and jazz elements is preferred in order to label a composition “Third Stream;” although, in some instances a composition may “tip the scale” further in one direction. Again, elements that Third Stream shares with jazz are the harmonic structure, rhythmic elements and possibly improvised sections. From classical practice, Third Stream takes a more formalized structure, a different sense of balance and orchestration. (See Table 3 below).

**Table 3: Elements of Third Stream**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Classical Influence</th>
<th>Jazz Influence</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>-Style, classical construction (form and melody)</td>
<td>-Melody-style, jazz scales, blue notes</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>-Meters-cross-rhythms</td>
<td>-Repetition</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>-Harmony</td>
<td>-Rhythm-syncopation/articulation, accents</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Typically utilizes basic triads</td>
<td>-Harmony</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>-Classical bass, bass clarinet, harp, piano</td>
<td>Utilizes extended chords (9ths, 11ths, 13ths)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Example <em>Creation of the World</em> (Milhaud)</td>
<td>-Modulations and tonal shifts are far more common, and occur more rapidly</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>-Tone color(s)-varied, distorted</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>-Instruments (saxophone, piano)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Example <em>Ebony Concerto</em> (Stravinsky)</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Bartók: Contrasts**

Béla Bartók’s *Contrasts* resulted from a somewhat casual conversation between József Szigeti and Goodman, but has become a significant chamber work. During the summer of 1938, Bartók was approached by József Szigeti, later joined by Goodman, to
compose a six-to-seven-minute piece in two sections that might possess the Hungarian flavor of Bartók’s violin rhapsodies. The work was to be short enough to fit one side of a twelve-inch 78 r.p.m record. However, the composer did not allow his work to be restricted by the demands of the recording industry, for the duo was presented with a two-movement trio in excess of eleven minutes in duration. Szigeti and Goodman, nonetheless, approved of the composition, which Bartók originally called *Rhapsody for Clarinet.*

In a letter to Bartók dated August 11, 1938, Szigeti outlined the piece he required from Bartók and reassured him about Goodman’s abilities:

I can assure you that whatever a clarinet is physically able to do at all, Benny can get out of the instrument, and wonderfully (in much higher regions than the high note of the “Eulenspiegel” [*Till Eulenspiegels lustige Streiche* by Richard Strauss]). But to a certain extent the records will show you his sound and virtuosity. Do not be frightened by the “hot jazz” records, he has already recorded the Mozart Quintet with the Budapest Quartet, and the next season he will play Prokofieff’s Chamber work for clarinet and strings in the New Friends of Music Series. The New York Philharmonic has also asked him to give a concert.46

*Contrasts* requires the clarinet to use an A-clarinet in the first movement (*Verunkos*) and second movement (*Pihenö*), and a B-flat clarinet in the third and final movement (*Sebes*). The beginning of the final movement calls for the use of a violin with several of its stings tune differently (scordatura). *Verunkos,* the first movement, is based on a dance, and characterized by a bouncy rhythmic figure (dotted eight-sixteenth), as seen in Example 1.47

---


The second movement, *Pihenő* (Relaxation), is purely atmospheric. Its lack of a strong pulse stands in contrast to the driving beats in both the outer movements. The final movements, *Sebes* (fast dance), is a frenzied dash, whose only detour is an off-balance, but still quick-moving section in the uncommon meter \((8 + 5)/8\). (See Example 2).


The beginning of the final movement calls for the use of scordature tuning in the violin. This yields a courser, rougher sound that suggests the playing of a folk musician. The

---


49Ibid.
clarinet part requires the use of both B-flat and A clarinets to more easily facilitate technical passages in different key signatures. Although, the first movement is scored for A clarinet, some players prefer to play it on B-flat clarinet. Using a B-flat clarinet makes certain technical passages easier to play. However, there are several low Es in the movement which the B-flat clarinet can not play, thus the transposition is somewhat problematic musically.

From classical practice, Bartók takes this instrumentation, (violin, clarinet and piano and the form: three movements in fast-slow-fast configuration. As with most of Bartók’s larger works of the 1930s, Contrasts contains a rich variety of scales, modem and interval cycles found in jazz and improvised music. The interaction of these scales plays a major role in the organization of the movement. Among the most prominent scales are the Lydian mode with a flat seventh (commonly found in Romanian music), other scales with the raised fourth, the natural minor scale, the octatonic scale, and the whole-tone scale.


![Example 3: Béla Bartók Contrasts. “Sebes,” mm 214-217.](image)

The instrumentation and form that is borrowed from classical music and the character and scale usage borrowed from folk music makes this work Third Stream.

Copland: Clarinet Concerto
Goodman commissioned a concerto from Aaron Copland at the beginning of 1947, just three weeks after entering into a similar arrangement with Paul Hindemith. The terms of both commissions were identical: in return for a fee of two thousand dollars, Goodman would have exclusive rights to perform the work for two years. Copland had already completed and premiered works such as *El Salón México* (1938), and *Rodeo* (1942) that add folk material. This material is used as a basis for an entire composition. In the case of the *Concerto*, jazz material is used mainly as well as North and South American popular music: Boogie Woogie and Brazilian folk tunes.\(^{50}\)

Copland scored the *Clarinet Concerto* for solo clarinet, stings, harp and piano. The work was completed in the fall of 1948, but Copland later revised the solo part in response to Goodman’s concerns about some high notes and other difficulties. Goodman did not premiere the concerto until a full two years later on November 6, 1950, on a radio broadcast with Fritz Reiner conducting the NBC Symphony Orchestra. Goodman and Copland subsequently performed the concerto together and recorded it twice: first in 1950 shortly after the premiere and again in the early 1960s.\(^{51}\)

The Clarinet *Concerto* features a slow-fast, two movement format, with the two movements linked by a clarinet cadenza. A cadenza is traditionally found in classical concertos and serves as a vehicle for demonstrating virtuosity. The slow movement is full and lush, and the cadenza that links the concerto’s two movements serves as the transition from dreamy nostalgia to jazzy vitality, or as clarinetist Richard Stolzman comments, “from classical chalumeau to licorice stick” (see examples 4 and 5).\(^{52}\)

---

\(^{50}\)Aaron Copland and Vivian Perlis, *Copland Since 1943* (New York: St. Martin’s Press, 1989.), 102-3.

\(^{51}\)Ibid.,102-5.

Example 4: Aaron Copland, Clarinet Concerto, cadenza.\textsuperscript{53}

\textit{Cadenza (freely)}
\begin{center}
\begin{tabular}{c}
\textit{(short)}
\end{tabular}
\end{center}

\textit{Somewhat faster}
\textit{accel.}

\textit{Twice as fast (lively)}

\begin{center}
\begin{tabular}{c}
\textit{hold back 
more 
deliberate}
\end{tabular}
\end{center}

\textsuperscript{53} Aaron Copland, \textit{Concerto} (Boosey & Hawkes, 1950).
Example 5: Aaron Copland, Clarinet Concerto, end of cadenza.

After the cadenza, the orchestra enters with new music as seen in example 6.

Example 6: Aaron Copland, Clarinet Concerto, mm. 120-126.
Through unified by motivic quotation, the concerto’s two movements present a contrast: the second movement is as sharp and fragmented as the first movement is warm and lyrical.

The first movement is simple in structure, based upon the usual A-B-A song form. Copland described the more complex second movement as “a free rondo form.” A rondo is a multi-part form found in classical music, typically diagrammed ABACA. In the case of the *Concerto* it is ABACA/DA. Copland’s “A” theme puts forth a jaunty, “staccattissimo” melody for the clarinet against a jazzy vamp in the lower strings; “B” contains two ideas, a syncopated chromatic passage and a singable, folklike fragment; “C” features faster, more frenzied syncopation; “D” marked “with humor, relaxed,” offers an additional contrasting section. The main “A” theme makes an appearance at the end of the piece accompanied by “B” material. The finale has a few references to jazz music where Copland uses florid runs in the solo line against a “walking bass,” as seen in example 7.

**Example 7**: Aaron Copland, *Clarinet Concerto*. Mm. 473-476.

54 Ibid., 105.
55 Ibid.
57 Copland, *Concerto*. 
From classical music, this piece appropriates a slow-fast format, the form of the individual movements, and the style and type of orchestration. From jazz music, there are rhythmic elements both in the solo clarinet part and in the orchestral accompaniment in the form of vamps and syncopated passages, as shown in example 8 below.

**Example 8:** Aaron Copland, *Clarinet Concerto*. Mm. 361-364.\(^{58}\)

![Example 8: Aaron Copland, Clarinet Concerto. Mm. 361-364.](image)

As with other Copland scores that utilizes jazz elements, the Clarinet *Concerto* poses the question of how far performers might go in “jazzing it up.” Copland requested that musicians play the rhythms as written, yet thought it beneficial for players to have some feeling for and knowledge of jazz. The Copland-Goodman renditions offer one solution to this inconsistency; they adhere to the notated rhythms while maintaining a lilt that has some relations to swing style. When Richard Stolzman took additional freedoms in the direction of real jazz, his interpretation elicited both praise and censure. At the very least, Stoltzman’s approach was commendable for its careful and imaginative attention to timbre, dynamics and attack.\(^{59}\)

**Hindemith: Clarinet Concerto**

Paul Hindemith’s *Clarinet Concerto* (1947) was commissioned and performed by Goodman. Today it is not played as regularly as Hindemith’s *Clarinet Sonata* but is still

---

\(^{58}\) Ibid.

\(^{59}\) Stolzman, *Clarinet Concertos*. 

36
part of the standard classical repertoire. Hindemith avoids any reference to Goodman’s jazz background (despite Hindemith’s own earlier interest in jazz), but the work is worth mentioning here because it demonstrates Goodman’s complete dedication to becoming considered as a ‘classical’ musician. The piece includes odd and frequently changing meter signatures, tricky accidentals and alternate fingerings. The work is noted for the elegance and the variety of the solo clarinet line, resulting in a wide range of notes and tone colors. The first movement is a symphonic allegro, lyrical and energetic by turns. In the short second movement, a beautiful pastorale is mainly gentle in mood, while the final rondo is a display piece. The clarinet part is marked by immense leaps illustrating Hindemith’s view of the clarinet as being both a lyrical and an agile instrument.  

Poulenc: Sonata for Clarinet and Piano.

Humorous and complex in nature, Francis Poulenc’s Sonata for Clarinet and Piano was the result of another commission by Benny Goodman. It was dedicated to and composed in memory of Arthur Honegger, a fellow member of “Les Six” who had died in 1955. By an ironic turn of fate, Poulenc died the year after composing the sonata, and the piece was premiered April 10, 1963 at a memorial concert for Poulenc himself, with composer Leonard Bernstein on piano and Goodman on clarinet.

Some similarities occur between this work and Poulenc’s earlier Sonata for Flute and Piano. The clarinet sonata adopts the familiar instrumentation of clarinet and piano found in chamber music. In Poulenc’s work, the clarinet and piano share an equal role in introducing themes and executing accompaniment figures, something that is found in both jazz and classical music. The first movement ends with a return to the original

---

60Paul Hindemith, Concerto for Clarinet and Orchestra (London: Schott, 1949).
themes resulting in a ternary (ABA) form, common to classical music. The original theme is shown in example 9 and the return to the original theme is shown in example 10 below.

**Example 9:** Francis Poulenc, *Sonata for Clarinet and Piano*, Mvt. 1, mm. 9-12.\(^{62}\)

```plaintext
\[\text{Music notation image}\]
```

**Example 10:** Francis Poulenc, *Sonata for Clarinet and Piano*, Mvt. 1, mm. 106-109.\(^{63}\)

```plaintext
\[\text{Music notation image}\]
```

In the second movement, following the introduction, Poulenc writes melodies that are reminiscent of the slower section of the first movement, a technique adopted from classical composition, as seen in examples 11 and 12.

**Example 11:** Francis Poulenc, *Sonata for Clarinet and Piano*, Mvt. 2, mm. 14-18.\(^{64}\)

\[\text{Music notation image}\]

---


\(^{63}\)Ibid.

\(^{64}\)Ibid.
Throughout the piece, but particularly in the third movement, Poulenc writes for the clarinet as if there were no limit to its range and altissimo note abilities. Poulenc expects the clarinet to play the highest notes with ease and then immediately drop down to its lowest notes as seen in example 13.

65 Ibid.

Stravinsky: Ebony Concerto

Stravinsky experienced a number of metamorphoses during his long creative life, but despite this, his work has an unusual unity. Stravinsky produced a very eclectic compositional output, using Russian folklore as in the three early ballets—*The Firebird* (1910), *Petrushka* (1911), and *The Rite of Spring* (1913), and Neo-classical music as in the ballet *Pulcinella* (1920) which was based partly on the music of Giovanni Battista Pergolesi (1710-1736) and opera *The Rake’s Progress* (1951) which was modeled after Mozart. Besides Russian-folk and traditional classical music, jazz music also influenced Stravinsky’s compositions. For Stravinsky, jazz inspired a continuation and strengthening of some of the devices he was already using before writing the *Ebony Concerto*. These devices include sharp rhythms, clean, unbroken tone color and simple construction. In this path are Stravinsky’s *Three Pieces* for solo clarinet and *Ebony Concerto* (1945) for clarinet and jazz band.  

---

66Ibid.

The *Ebony Concerto* was written for big band clarinetist and bandleader, Woody Herman, who hoped to initiate a fusion of classical and jazz. The concerto was completed in Hollywood on December 1, 1945, and Herman and his band gave the world premiere in New York less than four months later. Shortly after the premiere, Herman recorded the piece with Stravinsky himself conducting. Many years later Stravinsky made another recording, this time with Benny Goodman as the soloist.\(^6^8\)

The work is a concerto in three movements. It is very short, lasting only a few seconds over nine minutes. It is highly rhythmic- reminiscent of sections of Stravinsky’s earlier *L’Histoire du soldat*. The instrumentation is a typical jazz orchestra with a few additions: five saxophones, bass clarinet, five trumpets, three trombones, piano, harp, guitar, bass, percussion and horns. The second movement, *Andante*, is related more closely to jazz than any the other two by resembling a blues piece.

From classical music Stravinsky used sonata form in the first movement, *Allegro moderato*. The third movement, *Moderato; Con moto* follows a theme and variation arrangement, also a form found in classical music. Even the words, *Allegro* and *Andante* are tempo guides often found in classical music.

*Bernstein: Prelude, Fugue and Riffs*.

From the beginning of Leonard Bernstein’s composing career, jazz entered not only his theatre music but many of his concert works as well. Bernstein once wrote, “jazz in the twentieth century has entered the mind and spirit of America; and if an

\(^{68}\)Ibid.
American is a sensitive creator, jazz will have become and integral part of his palette, whether or not he is aware of it.\textsuperscript{69}

Originally intended for Woody Herman and his band, Bernstein’s \textit{Prelude, Fugue and Riffs} for clarinet and jazz ensemble (1949) was instead given its premiere by Benny Goodman during an \textit{Omnibus} television program entitled “What is Jazz?” on October 16, 1955. The sources of this piece are Swing and neo-classic Stravinsky, with clear forms, numerous ostinati, and clear textures. The forceful \textit{Prelude} is characterized by offbeat rhythms juxtaposed with a typical “big band” sound. The \textit{Fugue} is improvisatory sounding, while the finale \textit{Riffs}, suggests simultaneous improvisation.\textsuperscript{70}

**Conclusion**

In February 1956 Universal Pictures released \textit{The Benny Goodman Story}, a film depicting the life of Benny Goodman.\textsuperscript{71} It was a movie typical of Hollywood at that time. Many of Goodman’s life struggles in his childhood and later adulthood were brushed over, as it hinted only very briefly at the poverty that greatly shaped his life and his introduction to the music that saved it. The scene in which Goodman plays classical music at the home of John Hammond’s mother served only as a means to point out the


\textsuperscript{70}Ibid.

\textsuperscript{71}Firestone, \textit{Swing, Swing, Swing}.
most glaring differences between the “long-haired” classical music lovers and the jazz musicians in attendance\textsuperscript{72} and it was not even the right piece.\textsuperscript{73}

If nothing else, \textit{The Benny Goodman Story} brought its subject to the attention of a greater audience, due in large part to the quantity of recordings and press coverage that accompanied its release.\textsuperscript{74} Unfortunately, the picture itself is dreadful; the story is false, with stiff dialogue and blatantly contrived situations. At the very heart of the movie is the relationship between Alice Hammond (Duckworth) and Benny Goodman; however, that too was blatantly manufactured and served mainly as a way to thicken the plot rather than having a movie that was purely biographical. Tension between Goodman’s mother and Alice was created as well as Alice’s dislike for anything but “serious music.” Through Goodman, she was turned into a serious jazz fan.

The movie does show in a positive way that Benny Goodman was a successful musician, regardless of the musical style. Goodman had many of the qualities that are necessary for success in music, such as dedication, discipline, and determination. His childhood experience made him determined to work hard and be a success. His early studies particularly with Franz Schoepp tell of a discipline present at an early age. His desire to be a success not only in jazz music but also in classical music shows a determination that not many musicians of the time had. He led some of the most successful bands of the Swing Era and inspired some of the best jazz music written in that


\textsuperscript{73}According to various sources including Goodman himself, he played Mozart’s K. 581, yet in the movie they performed the third movement of Mozart’s Clarinet Concerto, K. 622.

\textsuperscript{74}Firestone, \textit{Swing, Swing, Swing}. 

43
era, yet he also caused many important classical clarinet works to come about. Goodman was a musician of the highest caliber and was willing to do anything to be a success.

The movie also shows that critical moment when Goodman puts his classical training aside and decides to join his first dance band. What makes this moment vital to this study is that Goodman might very well have had a successful career as an orchestral clarinetist or solo performer; unfortunately, he would have needed many more years of training at expensive schools. His career would not have started until he was in his late twenties-early thirties, and so with several young brothers and sisters at home to help clothe and fee, starting his career early made sense.

Goodman learned much of his work ethic from his father, David. In his father, he saw a man who worked difficult and sometimes degrading jobs. David Goodman worked up to the day he died even though he did not have to. For Benny Goodman, the lesson learned was to strive to become better. In many ways the ‘return” to classical music was a means to accomplish better things or to provide a challenge for himself, as Goodman would refer to it.  

Goodman would later write the following about the “two worlds” of music:

They’re two different worlds, classical and jazz music. You have a great deal of talk about how similar they are and how one of these days somebody is going to bridge the gap and make the two into one. Such talk, I think, is pure nonsense, because it doesn’t take into account the basic characteristics of these two similar yet different kinds of music. 

Goodman continued with a brief suggestion on how to study or practice each type of music. He described classical music as being “serious music” while jazz is fun and not

---

75 Benny Goodman, Benny, King of Swing: A Pictorial Biography Based on Benny Goodman’s One Archives, Stanley Baron, introduction (New York: Thames and Hudson, 1979).

76 Benny Goodman “University of Chicago.”
meant to be taken seriously. Goodman did not believe that jazz and classical music should be linked, yet in 1989 Gunther Schuller described Benny Goodman as a *Third Stream* musician and earlier in 1956 defined Third Stream as follows:

Third Stream is not jazz with strings, it is not jazz played on ‘classical’ instruments, it is not classical music played by jazz players, it is not inserting a bit of Ravel or Schoenberg between be-bop changes-nor the reverse. It is not jazz in fugal form, it is not a fugue performed by jazz players and it is not designed to do away with jazz or classical music; it is just another option amongst many for today’s creative musicians…by definition there is no such thing as ‘Third Stream Jazz.’

Regardless of whether Goodman agreed with the term *Third Stream* or even with the necessity of bridging the gap between classical and jazz music, according to Schuller’s definition, the term does fit as applied to Goodman. Goodman might have just been trying to find a means to better himself as a musician, but with each piece that Goodman commissioned – Béla Bartók’s *Contrast*, Aaron Copland’s *Clarinet Concerto*, Francis Poulenc’s *Sonata for Clarinet and Piano* (and many others) – he was essentially contributing to that bridge.

**BIBLIOGRAPHY**

**Articles**


---

77 Schuller, *Musings.*


Books


---

**Compact Discs**


---. **Clarinet Quintet.** New York: Pearl, 1999.


---

**Dissertation**


---

**DVD**


**Interviews**


Lewis, George E. Personal Interview. 4 Feb. 2005.


**Records**


**Scores**


---

**APPENDIX I**

**Summary of Recording Activity**

The Ben Pollack Era
September 14, 1926-December 11, 1929

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th># of recording sessions</th>
<th># of classical recordings</th>
<th># of jazz recordings</th>
<th># of recordings as leader</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>66</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>66</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

---

78 This information is taken from the published discography by Russell D. Connor

50
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Period</th>
<th># of recording sessions</th>
<th># of classical recordings</th>
<th># of jazz recordings</th>
<th># of recordings as leader</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>The Ben Selvin Era</td>
<td>158</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>158</td>
<td>19</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>January 16, 1930-March 30 1935</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The Benny Goodman Era</td>
<td>145</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>144</td>
<td>132</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>April 4, 1935-August 1939</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Columbia Red-Label</td>
<td>70</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>68</td>
<td>66</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>July 32, 1939-July 30 1942</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The War Years</td>
<td>45</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>45</td>
<td>20</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>December 13, 1942-February 4, 1945</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Postwar Columbia Records</td>
<td>84</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>82</td>
<td>60</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>February 25, 1945-January 27, 1947</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The Capitol Series</td>
<td>87</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>86</td>
<td>59</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>January 28, 1947-october 27, 1949</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Decade</td>
<td>Start Date</td>
<td>End Date</td>
<td># of recording</td>
<td># of classical recordings</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>----------</td>
<td>---------------------</td>
<td>-------------------</td>
<td>----------------</td>
<td>---------------------------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1950’s</td>
<td>Mid-April 1950-December 17, 1959</td>
<td></td>
<td>73</td>
<td>12</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1960’s</td>
<td>July 6, 1960-November 28, 1969</td>
<td></td>
<td>46</td>
<td>9</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1970’s</td>
<td>February 20, 1970-June 24, 1978</td>
<td></td>
<td>16</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1980’s</td>
<td>September 3, 1980-January 19, 1986</td>
<td></td>
<td>9</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

APPENDIX II
Classical Recordings

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Date</th>
<th>Major Works</th>
<th>Group/performers</th>
<th>Composer</th>
<th>Label/Venue</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>April 25, 1938-New York</td>
<td>Quintet for Clarinet and Strings</td>
<td>Budapest String Quartet and Benny Goodman</td>
<td>W.A Mozart</td>
<td>Victor</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>May 1, 1940-Hollywood</td>
<td>Clarinet Concerto</td>
<td>Leopold Stokowski, conductor</td>
<td>W.A Mozart</td>
<td>Hollywood Bowl</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>May 13, 1940</td>
<td>Contrasts for</td>
<td>Joseph Szigeti, Bela Bartok</td>
<td></td>
<td>Columbia</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

79 This information is taken from the published discography by Russell D. Connor
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Date</th>
<th>Location</th>
<th>Music</th>
<th>Performer</th>
<th>Location</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>December 16, 1940</td>
<td>New York City</td>
<td>Concerto for Clarinet and Orchestra; First Rhapsody for Clarinet Sonata No. 2</td>
<td>Nadia Reisenberg, piano</td>
<td>Columbia</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>December 26, 1945</td>
<td>New York City</td>
<td>Concertino for Clarinet and Orchestra</td>
<td>Donald Voorhees and his Bell Telephone Orchestra</td>
<td>Armed Forces Radio Service</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>June 3, 1946</td>
<td>New York City</td>
<td>Variations on a Theme from Don Giovanni by Mozart Grand Duo Concertante for Piano and Clarinet, Op. 48, in E-flat major</td>
<td>Nadia Reisenberg, piano</td>
<td>Armed Forces Radio Service</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>September 2, 1946</td>
<td>New York City</td>
<td>Concerto for Clarinet and String Orchestra; Two Rumanian Dances</td>
<td>Department of State-The Voice of America Concerto Series, Program No. 44</td>
<td>Copland; Bartók</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>November 5, 1950</td>
<td>New York City</td>
<td>Concerto for Clarinet and String Orchestra; Two Rumanian Dances</td>
<td>Department of State-The Voice of America Concerto Series, Program No. 44</td>
<td>Copland; Bartók</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>November 15, 1950</td>
<td>New York City</td>
<td>Concerto for Clarinet and String Orchestra (with Harp and Piano)</td>
<td>Aaron Copland, conductor and the Columbia String Orchestra</td>
<td>Columbia Japan</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>January 4, 1951</td>
<td>New York City</td>
<td>Quintet for Clarinet and Strings in A Major (K. 581)</td>
<td>The American Art Quartet</td>
<td>Columbia</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>January 15, 1951</td>
<td>New York City</td>
<td>Quintet for Clarinet and Strings in A Major (K. 581)</td>
<td>The American Art Quartet</td>
<td>Columbia</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Date</td>
<td>Composition</td>
<td>Performers</td>
<td>Label</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>--------------</td>
<td>---------------------------------------</td>
<td>------------------------------------------------</td>
<td>-----------------------------</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>March 1955- New York</td>
<td>Clarinet Quintet in B-flat Major, Op. 34</td>
<td>Berkshire String Quartet</td>
<td>Karl Maria von Weber</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Post-March 1955-Stanford</td>
<td>Trio in B-flat major for Piano, Clarinet and Cello, Op 11</td>
<td>Ludwig van Beethoven</td>
<td>Personal collection; Music Masters</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>July 9, 1956</td>
<td>Concerto for Clarinet and Orchestra in A K. 622</td>
<td>Boston Symphony Orchestra; Charles Munch. Conductor</td>
<td>W.A. Mozart Victor; RCA Australia; RCA Great Britain; RCA France Victor; RCA Australia; Eterna</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>July 12, 1956 Lenox, Mass.</td>
<td>Clarinet Quintet, K. 581</td>
<td>Boston String Quartet</td>
<td>W.A. Mozart</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>September 24, 1956 New York</td>
<td>Derivations for Clarinet and Band</td>
<td>Unknown orchestral accompaniment</td>
<td>Morton Gould UNISSUED</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>September 29, 1956</td>
<td>Derivations for Clarinet and Band</td>
<td>Unknown orchestral accompaniment</td>
<td>Morton Gould UNISSUED</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>May 1957- Stanford</td>
<td>Trio in A Minor for Clarinet, Cello and Piano</td>
<td>Berkshire String Quartet</td>
<td>Johannes Brahms Private Collection</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mid-October 1960-Chicago</td>
<td>Quintet for Clarinet and Strings, Opus 115 (excerpt)</td>
<td>Chicago Fine Arts Quartet</td>
<td>Johannes Brahms The Ed Sullivan Show</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>November 16, 1960-New York</td>
<td>Concerto for Clarinet and String Orchestra with Harp and Piano</td>
<td>The Orchestra of America; Richard Korn, conducting</td>
<td>Aaron Copland WNYC Radio Station</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Date</td>
<td>Concert</td>
<td>Orchestra/Ensemble</td>
<td>Conductor/Artist</td>
<td>Label</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>-------------</td>
<td>----------</td>
<td>-------------------------------------</td>
<td>--------------------------------------------</td>
<td>-------------------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>February 20, 1963-New York</td>
<td>Concerto for Clarinet and String Orchestra with Harp and piano</td>
<td>Columbia Symphony Strings; Aaron Copland conducting</td>
<td>Aaron Copland</td>
<td>Columbia</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>April 10, 1963</td>
<td>Sonata for Clarinet and Piano</td>
<td>Leonard Bernstein, piano</td>
<td>Francis Poulenc</td>
<td>Memorial Concert Columbia</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>April 25, 1963-New York</td>
<td>Derivations for Clarinet and Band</td>
<td></td>
<td>Morton Gould</td>
<td>Columbia</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>May 6, 1963-New York</td>
<td>Prelude, Fugue and Riffs</td>
<td>Columbia Jazz Combo; Leonard Bernstein, conducting</td>
<td>Leonard Bernstein</td>
<td>Columbia</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>May 2, 1964</td>
<td>Sonata for Clarinet and Piano, Opus 120, No.1; Sonata for Clarinet and Piano; Grand Duo Concertante for Clarinet and Piano, Op.48</td>
<td>Rachel Goodman, piano</td>
<td>Johannes Brahms; Bohuslav Martinu; Karl Maria von Weber</td>
<td>Lili Boulanger Memorial Fund Recital</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>April 25, 1965</td>
<td>Ebony Concerto</td>
<td>Columbia Jazz Combo; Igor Stravinsky conducting</td>
<td>Igor Stravinsky</td>
<td>Columbia</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>June 8, 1966</td>
<td>Concerto for Clarinet and Orchestra, Op 57</td>
<td>Chicago Symphony; Morton Gould, conducting</td>
<td>Nielsen</td>
<td>RCA Europe</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>